DFID Guidance Note
Part B

Addressing Violence against Women and Girls through DFID’s Economic Development and Women’s Economic Empowerment Programmes

February 2015

Georgia Taylor
with Emma Bell, Jessica Jacobson, and Paola Pereznieto
About this Guidance Note
This guidance note was produced by the DFID-funded Violence Against Women and Girls (VAWG) Helpdesk on behalf of DFID’s VAWG team in the Inclusive Societies Department (Policy Division). The lead author was Georgia Taylor (independent consultant), with research support from Emma Bell, Jessica Jacobson and Paola Pereznieto. The note was informed by technical advice from a group of experts: Dr Lyndsay McLean Hilker (Technical Team Leader of VAWG Helpdesk, Social Development Direct), Teresa Durand (independent consultant), Fatimah Kelleher (independent consultant), and Vanessa Farr (independent consultant).

It also underwent an extensive peer review process by a number of DFID advisors – David Elliot, Ruth Graham, and Cleo Blackman, Tessa Bolton, Polly Le Grand, Mamta Kohli, Karen Johnson, Helen Richardson, Sunitha Rangaswami, Fiona Power and Naved Chowdhury. We also appreciate the useful comments and inputs from staff from Mama Cash and the Open Society Foundations, Jo Morris (Fear Wear Foundation), Sabita Banerji (Ethical Trading Initiative) and Jennifer McCleary-Sills (The World Bank).

About the Violence against Women and Girls Helpdesk
The Violence against Women and Girls (VAWG) Helpdesk is a research and advice service for DFID (open across HMG) providing:

- Rapid Desk Research on all aspects of VAWG for advisers and programme managers across all sectors (requests for this service are called “queries”). This service is referred to as the “VAWG Query Service”.
- Short term VAWG expert Country Consultancy support in DFID programme countries including research and advice on programme design, formation of programme documentation, implementation, review and evaluation; referred to as “Short-term Country Assignments”;
- Technical Guidance Material primarily targeted to DFID staff, but also useful across HMG and development partners;
- Strategic Engagement and support to the DFID Inclusive Societies VAWG Team.

The Violence against Women and Girls (VAWG) Helpdesk Service is provided by an Alliance comprising of Social Development Direct, ActionAid, the Institute of Development Studies (IDS), International Rescue Committee (IRC), Womankind and a wider roster of experts. For further information, please contact: enquiries@VAWGHelpdesk.org.uk

Suggested citation
Contents
Overview .................................................................................................................................................. 5
1. Introduction: Outcomes, M4P and a note on social norm change ......................................................... 6
2. Situational analysis to identify options for the programme ....................................................................... 10
3. Outcome Area 1: Focusing on women’s and girls’ economic empowerment to prevent and protect from VAWG .............................................................................................................. 12
4. Outcome Area 2: Building capacity and approaches within the private sector to tackle VAWG .................................................................................................................................................. 21
5. Outcome Area 3: Securing political commitment, policies and laws ....................................................... 28
6. Cost-benefit and VfM analysis .................................................................................................................. 32
Annex 1: Examples of indicators by outcome and output for monitoring and evaluation ..... 35
Annex 2: Data for costing VAWG ................................................................................................................ 39
Glossary of terms

Violence against women is defined by the UN Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women, adopted by the General Assembly on 20 December 1993, as “any act of gender-based violence that results in, or is likely to result in, physical, sexual or psychological harm or suffering to women, including threats of such acts, coercion or arbitrary deprivation of liberty, whether occurring in public or in private life.” The term VAWG in this note ensures that the concept covers violence against girls. VAWG includes a broad range of different forms of violence, grounded in particular settings or situations, including (but not limited to) intimate partner violence (‘domestic violence’), sexual violence (including sexual violence as a tactic of war), acid throwing, honour killings, sexual trafficking of women, female genital cutting/mutilation (FGC/M) and child, early and forced marriage (CEFM).

Gender-based violence (GBV) is violence that is directed against an individual or group of individuals based on their gender identity. GBV encompasses violence against women and girls as well as against men and boys, people who are lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex (LGBTI), and other individuals who do not conform to dominant gender ideals.

Sexual and gender-based violence (SGBV) includes GBV and sexual violence. WHO defines sexual violence as “any sexual act, attempt to obtain a sexual act, unwanted sexual comments or advances, or acts to traffic women’s sexuality, using coercion, threats of harm or physical force, by any person regardless of relationship to the survivor, in any setting, including but not limited to home and work”. The term covers forced sex, sexual coercion and rape of adult and adolescent men and women, and child sexual abuse.

Preventing Sexual Violence in Conflict Initiative (PSVI) is a UK Government initiative led by the FCO.

Intimate partner violence (IPV) is defined by the WHO as “behaviour by an intimate partner or ex-partner that causes physical, sexual or psychological harm, including physical aggression, sexual coercion, psychological abuse and controlling behaviours.”

The “World of Work” is a concept used by the ILO to encompass such activities that are both paid and unpaid. Paid labour is an activity or service for which cash and/or in-kind payment is made. Unpaid labour comprises both “productive work” and “reproductive work”. Gender-based violence can take place in the workplace and in related contexts, for example, on public transportation going to or from work, particularly during a night shift. Finally, the “World of Work” concept recognises the critical role that household outputs, such as feeding and caring for family members, contribute to national economies by reproducing and sustaining the labour supply.

The informal sector is defined by the ILO as “broadly characterised as comprising production units that operate on a small scale and at a low level of organisation, with little or no division between labour and capital as factors of production, and with the primary objective of generating income and employment for the persons concerned”. However, in practice definitions vary between countries. Usually, informal sector enterprises are un-registered, non-tax paying and tend to usually (but not always) be smaller enterprises. Such employment is informal and non-tax paying also, and there is a lack of safety or job security. The informal economy is not usually included in the gross national product (GNP), unlike the formal economy. The formal sector: encompasses all jobs with regular wages, which are recognised as income sources on which income taxes must be paid.

Microenterprises are very small businesses, many of which are sole traders or usually with fewer than 5 employees. Each country has their own definition, which can also include turnover and assets and can differ by industry. In developing countries many micro-enterprises are in the informal economy.

2 Ogbuabor and Malaolu (2013) - definitions of the 'informal sector' in Nigeria include the following features: operating without regulation; not legally independent from the households that own or manage them; having a small number of employees; the production and distribution of illegal goods and services; and the non-reporting of legal economic activities
3 https://www.princeton.edu
4 http://www.businessdictionary.com/definition/formal-sector.html#ixzz3OuEGQ4gu
5 Kushnir, 2011
Overview

An estimated 35% of women - 818 million women globally - over the age of 15 have experienced sexual or physical violence. The most common form of violence is intimate partner violence (IPV) (30% of women globally) and 7% of women have experienced sexual violence by non-partners.

The economic cost of violence against women and girls (VAWG) can amount to between 1.2% and 3.7% of GDP, though new evidence will be available within the next few years. Women and girls experience violence in the home, in the workplace, in market places and on the way to work. This not only prevents women from earning an income but also restricts business productivity and profitability and therefore impacts on economic growth. Thus, any programme aiming to improve business performance or to increase women’s income, would be threatened or diluted by the impact of VAWG. In order to optimise economic development programmes it is therefore essential to address VAWG within these programmes.

Violence against women and girls (VAWG) also limits progress towards the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) by impacting on women’s and girls’ health, education, and participation in work. It violates women’s and girls’ human rights and can have a negative impact on long-term peace, stability and economic prosperity.

In line with its international and national commitments, preventing VAWG is a top priority for the UK Government and DFID’s Ministerial team. DFID’s approach to women’s and girls’ empowerment and to tackling VAWG includes a commitment to improve women’s and girls’ access to and control over economic assets.

For this guidance note the commitment is articulated in these two prioritised impacts (further information in Section 5):

- Women and girls in employment, trade, microenterprise and market places are free from violence and the threat of violence.
- Women’s and girls’ increased economic activity and economic empowerment helps to reduce VAWG and protect women and girls from violence.

The guidance note aims to provide practical advice and tips to DFID economists, private sector advisors, social development advisers and programme managers and other UK government departments. It aims to strengthen the impact of economic development programmes on preventing and responding to VAWG and in turn to increase the sustainable impact of economic development programmes. It is based on international good practice from bilateral and multilateral donors, UN agencies, international and national NGOs, and DFID’s own programming experience, as well as the latest academic research on women’s economic empowerment, private sector programming, and VAWG.

Part A sets out the strategic rationale for and broad approach to addressing VAWG in economic development programming and covers the following:

- Introduction and definitions relating to VAWG and women’s and girls’ economic empowerment
- Rationale for economic development programmes to address VAWG
- The context: VAWG in the home, in relationships, in the workplace, business and markets
- DFID’s vision and key outcome areas to address VAWG through economic development programming
- Principles to guide economic development programming related to VAWG

---

6 WHO the South African MRC and the LSHTM, 2013
7 Ibid
8 Klugman et al., 2014
9 DFID Research programme: What Works to Prevent Violence against Women and Girls’ programme, Component 3 will focus on determining and analyzing the economic and social costs of VAWG
10 Henderson, 2000
11 DFID, 2011; DFID, 2012
Part B (this part) provides specific guidance on designing programmes for each key outcome area:

- Defining outcome areas and notes on M4P and social norms
- Context and situation analysis
- Approach by outcome area – including case studies and building a theory of change
- Value for Money measurement

1. Introduction: Outcomes, M4P and a note on social norm change

This guidance note suggests outcome areas and suggested interventions to support the development of a theory of change for integrated economic development and violence against women and girls (VAWG) programming.

Programmes may choose one of a number of technical frameworks for undertaking analysis and design of the theory of change to guide and test the interventions. Most DFID economic development and private-sector programmes follow a “Making Markets Work for the Poor” (M4P) framework. This is a useful framework for ensuring programmes analyse and address systemic market barriers and constraints and that they work across institutions, individuals and the enabling environment for business. However, many programmes which integrate income generation and private sector approaches may not use M4P frameworks (e.g. an integrated nutrition and livelihoods programme, or a VSLA project, or economic empowerment of adolescent girls). This guidance note assumes that both M4P and other frameworks will be used, but has focused one section, 1.2, on analysing how an approach to VAWG and women and girls economic empowerment (WGEE) can be integrated into an M4P approach. This should help to guide other approaches, and there are case study examples of these further on in the document.

A note on social norm change is included in this introduction as this aspect will be essential to integrate across any programming in addition to, and integrated into, any framework that is used.

1.1 Key outcome areas

As described in Part A, DFID is committed to women’s and girls’ economic empowerment (WGEE) and to integrating gender equality in all economic development programmes. This implies making commitments to tackle VAWG within economic development programming. In line with the theory of change on VAWG, DFID has defined three outcome areas in which economic development programmes can strengthen their approaches to achieve the impacts mentioned in the overview (and in Figure 1 below):

- **Women and girls have assets, income, skills and power and agency to protect them from violence** (Increasing women’s and girls’ economic empowerment as a vehicle and pathway to tackling VAWG).

- **Businesses, employers, market places and associations** (including trade associations, business and development networks and women’s associations) **have policies, skills, partnerships and social norms to tackle VAWG** (prevention, protection and response).

- **Business and trade enabling environment** (including legal and regulatory environment) **does no harm, protects women and girls from violence and enables response**.

Sections 3, 4 and 5 of this guidance note (Part B) focus on each of the outcome areas in order to develop the theory of change further, provide guidance for analysis and programme design and illustrate the potential approaches with a range of examples.
1.2 M4P, Value Chains and gender

The most commonly used framework for DFID economic development programmes is the *Making Markets Work for the Poor* (M4P) approach. This entails an analysis of participants’ situation and the market in order to facilitate systemic change (see Box 1). In order to tackle VAWG within an economic development programme that uses an M4P approach, a solid gender analysis needs to be applied throughout the programme. This should lead to an approach to promote women’s and girls’ economic empowerment and include specific action to tackle VAWG.

**Figure 2: M4P Analysis shape**

- This should include analysis of the context for women and girls, whether they experience violence, and what the barriers are for WGEE.
- Analysis of the market system should also include identification of where women and girls are experiencing or at risk of violence within this system and social norms around masculinity and violence.
Box 1: Making Markets Work for the Poor

M4P is an approach aimed at effectively and sustainably improving the lives of poor people by understanding and influencing market systems. Applicable to development agencies and governments working in economic and social fields, it is defined by several characteristics:

- An approach that provides guidance on understanding the poor in market systems (analysis) and how to bring about effective change (action).
- A focus on developing market systems, by addressing underlying causes (rather than symptoms) of weak performance.
- An ambition to unleash large-scale and systemic change.
- A commitment to sustainability. This means considering not just the existing alignment of market functions and players but how they can work more effectively in the future, based on the incentives and capacities of players to play different roles.
- A facilitating role for external agencies; seeking to catalyse others in the market system (while not becoming part of it themselves).
- A means to complement and strengthen established development methodologies.


Market and system analysis is undertaken to design a programme with an M4P framework. This process should include gender analysis and investigation of the incidence, causes and impact of violence within women’s and girls’ communities and workplaces.

Figure 3: M4P lens on market system – with indication of WGEE and VAWG questions

The M4P figure 3 above shows an example of questions that may need to be answered in order to integrate an approach to WGEE and tackling VAWG. The questions should build understanding of
how women are interacting with the M4P system and whether they have the same access and representation as men.

Value chain and supply chain analysis can use a similar set of questions to understand where women are included in value chains, and how the structures and resources either enable or limit women’s participation in different functions of the value chain. This would entail looking at market, institutional and social interaction at each stage in the value chain or supply chain. It would also be important to assess the roles of women and girls at each point in the value chain and to see whether they could be involved in further, non-traditional, economic activity (see the “Core Function” in Figure 3).

When developing a programme approach it will be important to consider which of the VAWG outcome areas to focus on. An approach that works on all three outcome areas to some extent will be most comprehensive. The three outcome areas fit into the M4P Framework as follows:

**Outcome 1 (Women and girls have assets, income, skills and power and agency to protect them from violence)** focuses on women and girls and activity at the “core function” (in Figure 3) of demand and supply. Progress on this outcome will rely on progress on women’s and girls’ economic empowerment (see Part A for explanation and analysis of WGEE). This means there should be changes to **structure**, that include social norms around gender and violence as well as how these are embedded in institutional processes (i.e. “rules” in the M4P framework) and **resources** (i.e. “supporting functions” in the M4P framework). In this framework, supporting functions (or resources) are commonly related to private sector activity – for example financial services or business development services. However they could also be services to assist women and girls who have experienced violence, or to prevent violence in work situations (e.g. justice, police, health and education services).

**Outcome 2 (Businesses, employers, market places and associations policies, skills, partnerships and social norms to tackle VAWG)** is more concerned with private sector **actors**, including employers and business associations. These actors (known as “market players”) deliver and resource different functions in the market system (See Figure 2). They interact in all aspects of the market as employers, sellers, buyers, and providing supportive functions. Outcome 2 initiatives will have a focus on integrating gender equality, women’s economic empowerment and approaches to tackle violence within the organisations of these actors – at an institutional level. Outcome 2 is mutually supportive of Outcome 1.

**Outcome 3 (Business and trade enabling environment does no harm, protects women and girls from violence and enables response)** is most concerned with the lower part of the circle (sometimes known as the doughnut) in the M4P framework – the “Rules”. M4P approaches commonly work with the “rules” to improve conditions for businesses to start up, register and be profitable. However in an approach to tackle VAWG and build WGEE, rules and regulations are assessed to see whether they promote gender equality and to make sure they do no harm. Programmes could also introduce important policies, rules and codes around prevention of violence and around women’s ownership of and control over assets.

The “informal rules and norms” (bottom right of figure 3) are common to all of the three outcome areas. Social norms around gender equality and VAWG are relevant in communities, in families, within market systems, in private sector companies, in government and legislative bodies.

### 1.3 A note on social norm change

Social norms are an important aspect of market and private sector behaviour – based on the belief systems, informal rules and attitudes of people and institutions that act in the market. Social norms affect how people behave in informal and formal markets and enterprise, how decisions are made, who gets employed, what roles people play and how assets and resources are distributed. These social norms and beliefs are not just about economic exchange, but also about a person’s worth and capability and about what is/is not acceptable behaviour. There is also strong evidence that social
norms related to male authority, acceptance of VAWG, and female obedience increase the likelihood that individual men will engage in violence.\textsuperscript{12}

Work on social norm change is acknowledged as a priority for holistic approaches to tackle VAWG. This is also the case for tackling VAWG within economic development programmes. Some of the most effective approaches to prevent violence have combined economic initiatives with empowerment and social norm change approaches. These include approaches that combine community social norm change with communications, gender transformative approaches and approaches that work with both men and women.\textsuperscript{13}These kinds of social norm change initiatives have been implemented in communities and within institutions and corporations. For this reason the guidance note proposes integrating approaches to social norm change in activities related to all three outcome areas. Each section will make recommendations about how social norm change can be used in developing and implementing successful initiatives.

2. Situational analysis to identify options for the programme
Prior to developing intervention options in detail, DFID needs to understand the range of barriers that limit women and girls from earning an income and obtaining assets in a specific context. A full context and situational analysis should be undertaken, and should include gender analysis; analysis of prevalent social norms; analysis of the levels and types of VAWG; analysis of the barriers to VAWG prevention and response; and mapping of available response services. A mapping of private sector actors and public sector employers is essential to build a picture of the context and organisational interest in, and capability to address, VAWG within their own systems and procedures; and through partnership with specialist organisations. The stakeholder mapping should also include potential partners who can ensure access to essential services (including health services, access to legal services and enterprise related services, among others).

Depending on the type of employment or enterprise that women are involved in or have potential to be involved in, alongside a consideration of their household situation, programme options may consider working on Outcome area 1 or Outcome area 2 or both. Most comprehensive programmes will need to address some areas of Outcome area 3.

The questions below are intended to guide research and stakeholder mapping in order to develop options for a programme.

\textbf{Table 1: Suggested questions for situational analysis and stakeholder mapping (see also Annex 4 in Part A)}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Understanding levels of violence, barriers to WGEE and the relationship between them.</th>
<th>\textbf{\begin{itemize} \item Is there violence in the home, in workplaces or market places and/or on the way to work or to training?} \item What are the levels of sexual harassment, bullying, physical assault in the workplace? \item Are women and girls experiencing IPV or violence in the home? \item Who are the perpetrators of these different forms and locations of violence? \item What social norms support perpetration of VAWG in each case? \end{itemize}}</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What is the prevalence of VAWG, where is it happening and how are experiences related to income earning (if at all)?</td>
<td>\textbf{\begin{itemize} \item What is preventing women and girls from earning an income and owning fixed \item What are community, family and husbands’ attitudes to women’s and girls’ income earning and asset ownership? Does this differ by sector and type of activity? \end{itemize}}</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{12} Heise, 2012
\textsuperscript{13} Fulu et al, 2014
| Assets? | o Do women and girls have access to sexual and reproductive health and rights (SRHR) services and knowledge?  
| Are lack of education and knowledge limiting women’s and girls’ potential (aspirations, opportunities)?  
| o Are women’s household, caring and reproductive responsibilities limiting their ability to work outside of the home or to earn and independent income?  
| o Are women and girls able to make decisions about the use of their own money and assets?  
| Are there any networks or support systems that enhance women’s resilience and safety? | o Do women and girls receive help and support from family members or members of the community to prevent and escape from violence and/or to earn an income?  
| o Are there networks or associations that women can join to enhance business potential?  
| o Are women aware of their rights within the workplace and do they have confidence and avenues to speak out?  
| What is preventing or supporting women-owned enterprises to grow and thrive? | o Do women and girls have access to banking and business support services? If so, what kind of access is this and how does it differ from men’s access?  
| o What kind of education, skills training or business development services organisations provide services for women and girls?  
| o What kinds of ownership regulations and customary law exist that might affect women’s businesses and their control over their own assets (for land, assets and business ownership and control)?  
| Stakeholder capacity mapping | o Do businesses, markets and associations have systems and capacity to tackle VAWG?  
| o Do they know the extent of violence and the impact it is having on women and girls? Do they understand why this concerns them?  
| o What is the quality and effectiveness of current human resource management systems?  
| o Is there any VAWG reporting system or redress mechanism? Do employees know about it?  
| o Is there a budget to pay for workshops and activities within the business, public sector employer or association?  
| o What are the characteristics of social norms (including how masculinity and femininity play out) around gender equality and VAWG in the organisation?  
| Are there organisations with VAWG expertise that can partner with private sector companies and associations? | o Are there unions that include women in management positions and listen to women’s voices?  
| o Have unions or associations taken up VAWG as one of their responsibilities?  
| o Are there any networks or support groups for women at work?  
| o What public sector and civil society organisations can provide services to VAWG survivors?  
| Understanding the enabling environment for women’s rights in the workplace and in business | • Which discriminatory laws are in place that limit women’s ownership of assets, employment, women’s rights in divorce and child custody?  
| • How do these differ from customary laws and traditional practice?  
| • To what extent are laws and regulations limiting women’s business registration and profitability?  
| • What laws protect women’s equal rights in the workplace, including equal pay and access to maternity leave?  
| • What laws are in place to protect women’s rights and safety in the workplace?  
| • Are there public policies to enhance business codes of conduct, employment practice, health and safety and rights to association?  
| • What public policies exist to protect women and girls on the way to work and in work-related public spaces such as markets?  
| • To what extent are positive laws, regulations and policies implemented and what supports or limits this
3. Outcome Area 1: Focusing on women’s and girls’ economic empowerment to prevent and protect from VAWG

**KEY OUTCOME AREA 1: Women and girls have assets, income, skills, power and agency to protect them from violence** (Increasing women’s and girls’ economic empowerment as a vehicle and pathway to tackling VAWG.)

Violence can act as a significant barrier to women’s ability to function in employment, to work in markets and to earn an income. There are also a range of practical, social and cultural barriers that limit women’s and girls’ access to income earning opportunities, to services, assets and resources, and to positions of power and influence. This section focuses on interventions that address these barriers by providing opportunities for women and girls while at the same time tackling VAWG.

3.1 What are the challenges to be addressed?

*Women and girls often have limited experience and knowledge of employment in the formal sector, or of business, finance and marketing, in comparison to men.* This lack of knowledge and experience puts them at a power disadvantage and impacts on their self-esteem and perception of their capabilities and aspirations. As men are traditionally in control of finances and income earning, women may not tend to have control of family and business finance and decision making. Women’s lack of self-esteem and power also limits their ability to stand up to violence. Women and girls can lack knowledge of their rights, have little choice but to submit to cultural norms that require them to stay in a marriage even if it is abusive, and have limited ability to look outside of abusive relationships for support (both within families and communities, but also within business and market relationships). At the same time men may undervalue women’s and girls’ business and finance capabilities, thinking of them as lacking competence in these kinds of tasks. Men may also be concerned that women may gain power from the economic activities and income and so might resist this. (See Box 3)

**Box 3: Gender roles and power in Nigeria**

Research in Northern Nigeria showed men were worried that women earning an income would shift the balance of power. They were concerned that their wives would become “proud”, would not obey them and not respect them. “She may even look down on her husband – he may not have a say” Male Farmer in Northern Nigeria

Men’s roles were also linked to control and power:

“It is the man’s responsibility to go to the market and sell. Women should not be seen doing that - it is a disgrace. Any man that allows such is controlled by his wife. May God prevent us from such a wife!” Male Farmer in Northern Nigeria

*Source: Taylor et al, 2014*

*Lack of support in the household, poor health, and lack of time limits women’s ability to participate in income-earning activity (see also Part A page 11).* Predominant social norms around gender roles mean that men and boys rarely support their wives, mothers, or sisters in caring or household work. This means that women earning an income or working outside of the home have a
largely increased workload, much of which isn’t paid. This problem is often exacerbated in conflict-affected situations as women may also be caring for victims of gun crime, political violence or other forms of violence.

**Discrimination and lack of access to services such as financial services, or business development services** can act as barriers that limit women’s and girls’ access to economic opportunities. This discrimination and unequal access, and the isolation it brings, leads to women working in more vulnerable situations (both financially and personally), and sometimes increases women’s vulnerability to violence. Limitations to networking, organising and association may also undermine women’s ability to access support and collective action. Further, religious and cultural sanctioning of men’s control over women’s movements usually becomes more extreme when security deteriorates.

**Relevant support and service delivery organisations lack knowledge of and expertise on VAWG and how to respond to it.** Microfinance organisations, banks, business development services providers and business associations, often have limited or insufficient knowledge of the extent to which women and girls are experiencing violence, either in their personal lives or in the context of enterprise or employment. They are even less likely to know how to support women and tackle this violence, and many organisational cultures are unwilling to tackle the issue of workplace violence against women at all.

**3.2 Interventions to consider**

For all of the interventions listed in this section there should be a linked or integrated social component or approach (shown in the box cutting across all activities and outputs in Figure 4 Outcome 1 Theory of Change diagram on page 15). Ideally this would take the form of a gender transformative approach – using approaches such as gender dialogue groups, community mobilisation groups and/or mentor led groups (especially appropriate for young people). These approaches might focus on addressing negative masculinities and men’s attitudes to WGEE and VAWG, working on men and women’s joint decision-making power and communication and negotiating skills, building women’s and girls’ self-esteem, power and agency. The groups and discussions work best when integrated into the economic activities to ensure people’s participation and emphasise the relevance to the pressing needs in their lives.

Any of the following intervention strategies can be integrated into an M4P or Value Chain development programme as a sub-intervention or integrated into the overall approach.

(i) **Address women’s and girls’ financial exclusion, while at the same time building up their abilities and networks to protect them from violence.** This can be done by providing and/or facilitating access to finance and to financial services, including insurance, village savings and loans (VSL), microfinance, savings, mortgages, bank accounts and health insurance. Approaches are adapted to include group-based and individual skills-based work to enhance awareness of rights, self esteem and protective networks with others. This has been shown to be effective in increasing economic wellbeing and reducing violence in South Africa through the IMAGE programme (see Box 4).

(ii) **Develop skills training and safe employment opportunities (including for vulnerable workers such as migrants) that include approaches to enhance women’s and girls’ knowledge of their rights and access to resources.** Secure employment with a reliable income is the most useful type of income earning for women and girls, particularly those who are most vulnerable (like migrant workers, sex workers, disabled women or those with no assets). Skills training needs to be designed with an understanding of the employment market and linked to employment opportunities. This may include internships, trial and work experience placements, especially for girls and young women. It also needs to integrate the development of personal skills to increase power and agency. The ELA programme in Uganda (Box 5) shows how girls provided with a combination of employment and life skills were able to reduce their vulnerability to coerced sex and unsafe sex while increasing their engagement in income-earning activities. The GEFONT example in Nepal (Box 6) demonstrates how training and networks can decrease migrants’ vulnerability to violence during their search for employment.
**Box 4: IMAGE: Intervention for Microfinance for AIDS and Gender Equity (IMAGE) Project (South Africa)**

IMAGE is a microfinance intervention (individual borrowing and repayment of loans over 10 or 20 week cycles) that integrates a curriculum on gender and HIV into the women-only loan meetings. This is done through the *Sisters for Life* curriculum, which included discussion of gender roles, cultural beliefs, relationships, VAWG and HIV. The intervention uses participatory methods to increase women’s communication and critical thinking skills and confidence. The curriculum was developed with a South African domestic violence NGO, and was delivered in one-hour sessions over ten weeks.

The evaluation used a robust cluster RCT methodology to test different combinations of interventions. This was done through pair matching villages in the rural Limpopo province of South Africa, which were randomly allocated to either receive the intervention immediately, or to act as the comparison group and receive the intervention at a later date. The three groups were:

1. Four villages with 2 year exposure to IMAGE (combination of microfinance and gender and health training)
2. Four villages with 2 year exposure to only microfinance
3. Four control villages with no intervention

The study found that after two years the women in the IMAGE intervention and the microfinance intervention both showed improvements on all nine indicators of economic wellbeing (e.g. household asset value, ability to meet household needs, ability to repay debts), compared to the control group. However, only the IMAGE group showed improvements on women’s empowerment, experience of intimate partner violence, and HIV risk behaviour—women who participated in IMAGE showed a 55% reduction in experience of physical or sexual IPV (statistically significant).

*Source: Pronyk et al. (2006); Kim et al. (2009)*

**Box 5: Case study: Empowerment and Livelihood for Adolescents (ELA) programme (Uganda)**

The ELA programme in Uganda is an example of a programme that works solely with adolescent girls to build their social and economic capabilities. It aimed to empower adolescent girls aged of 14 - 20 to handle both health and economic challenges, through providing 1) life skills to build knowledge and reduce risky health behaviour, and 2) vocational training to help girls establish small enterprises. Vocational training provided by professionals and the staff of the implementing NGO (BRAC), on a range of skills girls could apply to either waged or entrepreneurial work, though the intent was to encourage girls to establish their own small-scale enterprises. These skills included hair dressing, tailoring, computer, agriculture, poultry rearing and how to trade, and were supplemented by courses on financial literacy.

Unlike other similar interventions with adolescent girls, this initiative was not school-based, but implemented through girls’ clubs, with both in- and out-of-school girls - ensuring more vulnerable, out-of-school girls could be included. The programme also organised the clubs at times that would not interfere with girls’ schooling.

A RCT found positive changes for participating girls after two years: improvements in HIV and pregnancy related knowledge; reduction in risky health behaviours (e.g. among sexually active girls, 50% increase in routine condom usage); 35% increase in the likelihood of girls being engaged in income-generating activities (mainly through increased self-employment); and a near elimination of girls reporting recent experiences of having sex unwillingly (down from a baseline of 21% of girls reporting having recently had sex unwillingly). The programme did not measure any wider changes in community attitudes or social norms but did find an impact on girls’ investment in their education.

*Source: Bandiera et al. 2012*
(iii) Provide social protection (including cash transfers) and subsistence asset support for women and girls who have no options for earning an income and who need to develop resilience for future potential. This can include women and girls who are exclusively involved in caring and household work, or who are so vulnerable that they need to develop their resilience before taking advantage of other economic opportunities. All social protection approaches should include specific interventions to increase women’s and girls’ resilience across all dimensions (psychological and physical health, social support networks, skills and abilities, self-worth/self-esteem), protect them from violence and enhance potential for future paid work and enterprise. In some cases, such as the M-Pesa scheme in Kenya (Box 7), cash transfers alone led to a decrease in IPV. However, there is also evidence from several contexts that cash transfers without gender transformative work can increase the risk of violence in certain contexts14. It is therefore considered good practice to include a gender component in social protection programmes.

Box 6: Nepal - Partnership between Anti Slavery International, KAFA and the General Federation of Nepalese Trade Unions (GEFONT)
An innovative partnership between two NGOs (Anti Slavery International and KAFA) and the General Federation of Nepalese Trade Unions (GEFONT) was established to implement a joint project to address violence against female migrant labourers. Through a combination of policy advocacy, grassroots organising and provision of legal aid, the intervention aimed to ensure that Nepali domestic workers migrating to Lebanon are able to protect themselves from exploitation and abuse and assert their rights, and that governments in both countries make the protection of migrants’ rights a greater priority.

The programme delivers a set of interventions for women labour migrants, who travel from Nepal to Lebanon, via India, combining pre-departure training (with a focus on rights awareness rather than skills training) with post-arrival community building. The intervention creates a ‘corridor’ for these women, targeting them at all stages of their migration: in their home country, whilst in transit to their destination country, and then whilst working in their destination country.

The programme has faced challenges finding women pre-departure, as there is great stigma attached to women who migrate for this domestic labour, and thus women tend to hide their plans to migrate. The project overcame this by working with locally trusted actors, female community health volunteers (FCHVs), who play a key role in bringing health services to rural Nepali women. This was successful due to the reach of these volunteers even in rural areas, and their trusted relationships with women.

Source: Guichon 2014; personal communication with OSF staff

Box 7: M-Pesa Unconditional Cash Transfers in Kenya
In 2011-12, Give Directly used the mobile money platform M-Pesa to administer unconditional cash transfers (UCTs) to the general population in Kenya, based on only one criterion: that they live in a thatched roof house, as a proxy for poverty and rural location. There was no conditionality for the cash transfer and also no implication that the money should be spent in any particular way.

Three UCT design features were randomised, to understand what kinds of UCTs led to different outcomes: whether the husband or wife within a household received the transfer; whether the transfer was made via nine monthly instalments, or one lump sum; and the size of the transfer, either $300 or $1,100.

A 2013 RCT showed overall significant impact on intimate partner violence (IPV), both physical and sexual, with a 30-50% reduction in reports of physical IPV, and 50-60% reduction in reports of rape within marriage. Moreover, while the effects were larger when the transfer was made directly to the woman, there was still a reduction in IPV when the transfer was made to the man.

Interestingly, the study also found significant spill-over effects in terms of changes in women’s empowerment (and IPV is one indicator of this) in the broader community, but the study concludes that more research is needed to understand whether this is due to the UCT intervention.

Source: Haushofer and Shapiro 2013

14 Heise, 2012
(iv) Expand and improve business development services, enterprise support and skills and resources for market development and value chain inclusion for women and girls. This should be offered alongside the development of women’s and girls’ resilience. Approaches similar to skills training and financial inclusion can be used. However, business development services and enterprise support can also include market based networking and market development for women owned businesses, which must be undertaken with a gender sensitive approach and an awareness of the violence and transactional sex\(^\text{15}\) that might occur within the sector.

(v) Introduce and build women’s collective action, business associations and unions to support women and girls in enterprise, markets and employment (public sector and formal and informal private sector), while at the same time building their individual and collective resilience and social support networks. This is one of the most neglected intervention areas and has the least evidence of good practice. However, there is wider evidence that women’s organisations, networks and collective action are an important part of tackling VAWG within economic development programmes. It is important to recognise, however that women’s CSOs and networks sometimes require significant capacity building. International funds such as Mama Cash, the UN Women Trust Fund to end VAWG and the Global Fund for Women all have good experience of funding women’s groups.

3.3 Evidence and lessons learned

Social approaches

All of the suggested strategies above have both an economic component and a social component, and in many cases these are completely integrated in terms of how they are implemented. The evidence suggests that economic approaches should be combined with social approaches to have the greatest impact on tackling VAWG.\(^\text{16}\) Combined programmes refer to the “non-economic” (or social) component as the ‘gender component’, the ‘gender transformative component\(^\text{17}\), or the ‘gender training component’, which is normally group work that includes gender training, awareness raising, discussion, or a combination of these. Because there are only a few high-quality evaluations or research studies that show effective approaches, it is not possible to be prescriptive about which social approach to use with each initiative. However this list provides a roundup of the types of approaches that have been used in successful programmes:

- **Curricula** that cover a broad range of topics, including, for example, gender issues, household relations or division of labour (including norms around financial and other decision-making), communication skills, rights (including around violence), health (often HIV), and VAWG. Examples of these include: Sisters for Life, Stepping Stones, Talking about Talking, Gender Dialogue Groups.
- **Village Savings and Loans (VSL) groups** that discuss gender roles and relations and men’s involvement in care work. CARE Rwanda has implemented this approach, and the success of the VSL project was thought to be partially dependent on these discussions.\(^\text{18}\)
- **Single-sex groups and couples-based mixed-sex gender discussion groups.** A mix of single-sex and mixed-sex discussions over the course of a programme has been shown to be effective.
- **Targeting of young men alongside young women as primary beneficiaries**, rather than just as women’s partners. This approach tends to be used when working in schools or with youth.

---

\(^\text{15}\) Sex in exchange for money, school grades, market position, favours or security (for example) – often undertaken by women or girls who have no other choice.

\(^\text{16}\) Ellsberg et al. 2014; Fulu et al., 2014

\(^\text{17}\) Fulu et al, 2014

\(^\text{18}\) Slegh et al., 2013
• Inclusion of a community mobilisation component - although this component is usually poorly evaluated. A good example of the use of this component is IMAGE, which included women going into their community to mobilise men and youth to participate in activities such as public marches around the 16 Days of Activism.

• Mentor-led groups with adolescent girls\textsuperscript{19} (safe spaces) or counsellor-led groups with survivors of VAWG and refugees, as seen in Ghana.\textsuperscript{20} This is effective when working with vulnerable groups. For example, a World Bank-supported trial in the DRC showed significant reductions of violence-related trauma symptoms and significant increases in women’s earnings among participants in a Village Savings and Loans Association with an added psychosocial support component.\textsuperscript{21}

Economic development approaches and WGEE

Joint/mixed or integrated interventions providing technical, financial and commercial skills and services alongside life skills and other training services (including gender training) appear to deliver the best results for women’s economic empowerment.\textsuperscript{22}

Financial services: access to credit enables businesses to grow, leading to higher levels of assets and, in some cases, profits, because businesses can then invest in capital. Furthermore, households that have access to microfinance are able to smooth consumption and are thus less likely to suffer from food shortages. However, the overwhelming majority of studies looking at microfinance as a single intervention found that it has no effect on female bargaining power in the household, expenditure on female goods or on children, or even female health outcomes like later age at marriage, more knowledge of how to avoid sexually transmitted infections (STIs), or a decrease in unwanted pregnancies.\textsuperscript{23}

Skills training and business development services: business development services are rarely implemented alone and are usually combined with either microfinance or skills training. In combination this is an effective approach to improving business management expertise and performance. Overall, skills training programmes seem to have a positive effect on women’s economic empowerment. The vocational courses tend to have some impact on the probability of being employed (in part because women typically make the effort to become self-employed). However, across several evaluations, life skills courses had a small impact on sexual practices and health, leading to weaker results. When, however, the two components – vocational and life skills – are packaged together, there can be strong results in both areas (labour market outcomes and life skill outcomes).\textsuperscript{24}

Box 9: Business development, women’s empowerment and microfinance in Nepal

One model of ‘microfinance plus’ business development is the WORTH programme in Nepal, which was evaluated by the Valley Research Group and Mayoux (2008). WORTH is a women’s empowerment programme that combines business, banking and literacy – in which women become social activists, social entrepreneurs, and effective leaders who bring about change in their communities. The evaluation demonstrated many results: high levels of loans and increases in the size of village banks; improvements in self-confidence among women; a decrease in violence (gender-based); an increase in community participation and literacy; and an increase in the value and quality of social capital in the form of the WORTH groups. Most of the groups and village banks had also continued to function long after the project had ended.

Source: Mayoux 2008

\textsuperscript{19} Austrian, 2011
\textsuperscript{20} Meija, 2014
\textsuperscript{21} IRC, 2013
\textsuperscript{22} Taylor et al 2014
\textsuperscript{23} Taylor et al 2014
\textsuperscript{24} Taylor et al 2014
Social protection: social protection, mostly in the form of cash transfers, can sometimes help to prevent violence, but can also increase the risk of violence (similarly to broader WGEE interventions). There appears to be a transition in social norms around access to finance and control over assets, depending on the other benefits that come with the cash transfer (e.g. bank account, financial literacy). On occasion social protection projects will provide assets or access to land. This can be a powerful element of WGEE and ownership of land and fixed assets may offer women a more stable exit strategy or bargaining position than employment, and as such may have a more positive relationship with VAWG reduction.

Collective action: there is good evidence to suggest that WGEE is enhanced through collective action. However, this is variable and depends on the action to address social norms around gender within the project.

Box 10: Example of collective action

A Fairtrade project evaluation in Nicaragua found that the FT/organic (male and female) co-operatives reported higher empowerment levels than the conventional co-op, but lower than the women-only FT co-op. They attributed this to men occupying all the leadership positions in the FT/organic co-op, while fewer women in this co-op held land titles. However, although members of the co-ops demonstrated a strong sense of collective empowerment, interviews with individuals within households revealed uneven gendered empowerment processes, and more diverse gender relationships. Some households had maintained, or carried forward, the equity achieved in the co-op to their intra-household relationships, but others had not — that is, gender inequities occurred at the household level even when they were not perceived at the co-op level.

Source: Bacon 2010

---

25 Vyas and Watts 2009
26 Baden, 2013
Box 11: Story of a woman leader and Collective Action in Mali

Known as Maimouna in her village, Maminè Sanogo, 50, was born, lived, and married in Kaniko. She went to school and got involved in community development activities from a young age. She is now a member of several women’s organisations at the regional, national and international levels. Her village went through tough times, with social conflicts between opposing groups. Maimouna became convinced that women could bring peace back into the village:

‘I thought that if women of my village managed to unite within a single development organisation, they would contribute to re-establishing peace in the village and would gain respect from their husbands and other men... I pondered and realised that the only economic resource that was exclusively under women’s control in Minyanka society was Shea. I also knew, from trainings, that improved butter was more remunerative. So I mobilised the co-operative members (women) and convinced them to get trained to produce improved Shea butter. Today, every woman from the co-operative that is involved in improved Shea butter production says that she derives important revenues from it.’

According to Maimouna, a group leader needs to exert caution, to be strong-minded, and good at making decisions (including unpopular decisions that ultimately benefit the group). In 2009, the Uyelo Co-operative earned 1.5 million FCFA at a commercial fair in Dakar, Senegal. Every woman in the co-operative was keen to share the dividends among its members. ‘But I refused’, says Maimouna. A few months later, a local development agent offered to build an improved Shea butter processing unit, provided the co-operative could contribute 2 million FCFA towards it. Maimouna presented the 1.5 million FCFA she had put aside, and the members provided the remaining 500,000, and the group succeeded in getting its own processing unit. All the women thanked her for her vision.

Maimouna was also able to make men in her village and in other villages aware of the necessity to give plots of land to women so that they could plant Shea trees. Wherever she went, she talked to men, they listened to her, and agreed to allocate two to three hectares to women’s groups for planting Shea trees. She has also noticed that many men have begun to plant Shea trees in their own fields. ‘This,’ she says, ‘is one of my greatest satisfactions in life!’ Men in her village now support the women’s Shea co-operative in various ways. The village chief says that the future is in women’s hands.

Source: Baden, 2013
Figure 4: Developing a theory of change: Outcome 1

1. Women and girls have assets, income, skills and power and agency to protect them from violence. (Women and girls' economic empowerment increases as a vehicle and pathway to tackling VAWG)

- Women and girls have access to financial services and have skills and knowledge to use services
- Women and girls access appropriate employment and are supported by networks and associations
- Women and girls earn income, own assets and are in control of income and assets so that they have independent decision making capability
- Women and girls' enterprises are better managed and more profitable

Social norms around women and girls' economic empowerment are more supportive and do not increase risk of violence. Women and girls income earning, self esteem and economic decision making is supported within families and communities, and markets. Women and girls have access to essential services to prevent and address VAWG.

Interventions:

- Financial services – insurance, VSL, microfinance, savings, mortgages, bank accounts etc.
- Skills training and employment opportunities – such as internships and placements
- Cash transfers and subsistence asset support
- Business development services, enterprise support; Market development and value chain inclusion for women and girls
- Women's collective action, business associations and unions support W&G in microenterprise, informal enterprise and markets

All interventions should include elements to build women and girls capabilities and networks – self esteem, knowledge of rights, leadership skills and other, organisation and cooperation; Intervention to change social norms around women's equality, economic rights, and VAWG, in the family, community and market – gender and VAWG; Facilitate access to essential services – VAWG/Health/security/legal services/safety; gender and relationship skills and training.
4. Outcome Area 2: Building capacity and approaches within the private sector to tackle VAWG

KEY OUTCOME AREA 2: Businesses, employers, market places and associations (including trade associations, business and development networks and women’s associations) have policies, skills, partnerships and social norms to tackle VAWG (prevention, protection and response).

4.1 What are the challenges to be addressed?

Market actors such as businesses, market place management, and associations are institutions where VAWG can take place and where negative masculinities and social norms that condone VAWG can thrive. Businesses and associations are also important institutional actors in economic development programmes and present opportunities to promote and catalyse change for women and girls. Particular challenges include:

- Leadership and management commitment is essential for any organisation to start addressing VAWG. A manager’s own social norms and beliefs may act as a barrier itself.
- Some businesses, markets or associations may not have basic systems and organisations in place to tackle VAWG. This could include human resource systems, communications systems and management monitoring. Lack of human resource systems and functions can limit the progress that can be made to introduce approaches to prevent and address VAWG in the workplace. In a small or micro enterprise this would have more to do with leadership and management commitment.
- Weak employee or market actor voices, and lack of inclusion of women, can mean there is limited demand for change. This is compounded by the fact that women may fear losing their jobs or livelihood if they complain.
- Companies and associations may not know about or understand the impact that workplace violence is having on women and girls in the workplace. Because women may be scared to speak out or acknowledge their difficulties in the workplace, VAWG may remain silent and secret. Likewise women may have no one to support them if they are experiencing IPV or violence from family members and this may be affecting their work and working relationships. Organisations are unlikely to acknowledge or understand this and may not be supportive of women who have experienced violence.

4.2 Interventions to consider

(i) Support unions, collective action and social dialogue to address VAWG and gender inequality in the workplace.

VAWG thrives when it is secret and silent and/or condoned by the majority. When women and girls have a voice, speak out, and gain power, they have more of a chance of bringing violence into the open and developing approaches to tackle it. Unions are an effective way of raising women’s voice, but women’s, as well as men’s inclusion in the trade union is essential for action to be taken. As the ITF states: “VAW is a trade union issue and trade unions can and do make a difference, supporting women, raising awareness, negotiating policies with the employer and campaigning with others to strengthen legal rights”.

There are some useful examples of ‘unions in action’, from Angola, Kenya, Uganda, Bulgaria, Spain, UK, Algeria, Tunisia, Canada, Mexico, Barbados, Argentina, Australia, Indonesia, and India, including campaigning, education, understanding links between VAWG and other issues (e.g. HIV/AIDS, see Uganda), developing policies and strategies (see Bulgaria), self-defence courses for women workers.

---

27 International Transport Federation (ITF), 2013
(Bulgaria), organising public publications and events (Spain), and advocating for transparent investigation of cases of violence (UK). See Box 12 and 13 for examples of action taken by unions.

**Box 12: Red Flag Women’s Movement (RFWM) in Sri Lanka**

The RFWM is a group of women workers on tea and rubber plantations, garment factories, and domestic workers in Sri Lanka. The group works to support other women workers take up leadership positions in their trade unions, through building women workers’ capacity to: address women’s labour rights and advocate for issues such as the inclusion of minimum wage, sexual harassment in the workplace, and health and safety issues in policy and company management. The group has in one case supported the creation of a new, women-led trade union for domestic workers.

These capacity-building activities have led to more capable, active women workers, with growing membership of women in all three trade unions; the establishment of committees at the plantation- and district-levels with women representatives on these committees; advocacy events organised around May Day and International Working Women’s Day (at which they set up community information booths, including on issues of VAWG, including with legal information for VAWG survivors); and gender training for 50 male workers, which included modules on VAWG in the workplace and at home.

*Source: Mama Cash, 2014*

**Box 13: The Role of Unions in Kenya, Uganda, Canada and Australia**

--> The Kenya Dock Workers' Union reports 'dramatically decreased' VAWG after its campaigning work on gender, child abuse and women’s rights protection.

--> The Amalgamated Transporter and General Workers' Union (ATGWU) of Uganda does GBV education through union task teams, composed of sex workers, truckers, health workers, local council reps, and police; these teams meet monthly to help the union develop its work on SGBV in relation to its HIV/AIDS programme. ATGWU has worked with Raising Voices to train HIV peer educators on SGBV as well.

--> The Canadian Auto Workers’ Union (CAW) set up a women’s advocate programme to assist women facing violence in their lives, at home or at work - similar to a referral programme. There are now 262 women advocates, and CAW has negotiated an employer-paid training fund for them.

--> The White Ribbon Campaign in Australia, which has a workplace accreditation programme to recognise and accredit workplaces that are taking active and effective steps to stop men’s violence against women. This includes the 2013 campaign, “Real men don’t abuse women”, which aims to spread the message that violence against women is unacceptable and to encourage more men to speak out against it.

*Source: International Transport Federation (ITF), 2013*

(ii) Develop company policies and leadership that promote gender equality, women’s rights, access to services and non-tolerance of VAWG. For any change to take place within companies or other private sector institutions there needs to be a strong commitment from leadership. This is articulated and communicated through policy and direct action. Development of an organisational policy to tackle VAWG requires an understanding of the context of the particular organisation. It needs to be developed through an inclusive process in order to ensure the commitment of gatekeepers, in particular, and all employees. The development of a company policy on VAWG can be seen as the beginning of a norm change process and can be a powerful way of bringing the workforce together on the issue. However, considerable further action and redress processes are needed to ensure this turns into sustainable norm and culture change within the organisation. (see Box 13 and 16)

(iii) Strengthen human resource systems and integrate action to address VAWG, including procedures for complaints and redress (see Box 14). Human resource management is an essential

---

28 International Transport Federation (ITF), 2013
function for ensuring workers know their rights and that these are upheld. Basic functions need to be in place in order to begin integrating systems to report on and address VAWG. A complaint procedure should contain at least the following elements:

- A step-by-step procedure for reporting and processing a complaint with a suitable time limit for each step;
- Strict procedures around confidentiality;
- Safety measures to protect survivors reporting abuse;
- An investigation procedure; and
- A safe and confidential appeal procedure to enable a dissatisfied party to appeal against the outcome of an investigation to a higher authority.

Box 14: Preventing Workplace Violence programme in garment factories in India and Bangladesh

Forms of harassment or violence – ranging from verbal and physical abuse and sexual harassment, to forced labour, assault and rape – are reported by a disturbingly high percentage of female garment workers. Challenges to detecting and addressing the problem include:

- female workers are reluctant to speak up about harassment because they fear being stigmatised, don’t trust management and are likely to lose their job
- factory systems to report problems are not trusted
- harassment and violence is difficult to detect in factory audits
- senior management may not see the problems or want to deal with VAWG

The Fair Wear Foundation (FWF) Preventing Workplace Violence project is a partnership between Indian and Bangladeshi garment factories, European clothing brands, governments, civil society organisations and trade unions in Europe and Asia. Together, they are piloting new ways to address and remedy the root causes of workplace violence. The programme aims to assist factories implement legislation requiring all workplaces to set up sexual harassment committees and implement complaints procedures on sexual harassment. The programme targets training of both managers and workers (predominantly young, poor rural female migrants) on the production line and mainly male supervisors, (often the perpetrators of physical violence and sexual abuse). In cases when workers have questions about their rights, or when the anti-harassment committees are not yet functional, they can also call the FWF helpline.

Initial results show that workers are more confident about raising and solving problems together with managers; and the election of anti-harassment committees is a major step towards better dialogue between workers and managers.

Source: Fair Wear Foundation (2013)

(iv) Develop a benefits, social support and referral system for employees to support those who have experienced violence. Because of the large costs associated with VAWG, both in the workplace and IPV, companies can realise that it is worth investing in benefit systems that address the impact of violence on the individual. Some companies which have health insurance could explore including specific VAWG related services within those policies, such as psychological support or legal services. Organisations should also ensure they have reliable services to refer women to. One company in Spain has seen how this approach can improve women’s lives and business success (See Box 14). Another approach in Papua New Guinea focuses on building women’s empowerment within the community to avoid violence related to mining business (see Box 16).

---

29 Ministry of Human Resource, Malaysia, 1999
Use communications and workshops to build knowledge and understanding of gender equality, rights of women, and non-tolerance of discrimination and VAWG (see Box 12). A whole company approach, with internal champions, is required in order to achieve social norm change. This includes scrutiny of the company structure, including representation of women in management and power shifts. Making the economic case is an important part of building a critical mass of supporters within the organisation to tackle violence. Information on increases in productivity and profitability as a result of such changes should therefore be fed into the process (see the GEM example in box 17).

---

**Box 15: Building employee resilience and healing in Spain**

Since November 2011, Danone Spain and the Danone Ecosystem Fund, in partnership with the Ana Bella Foundation, have run a Social School for Women Empowerment to help abused women become more autonomous in their lives and better integrated into society. The women benefit from personal coaching, social workshops, and professional training. With the aim to become financially independent, they are offered job opportunities by Danone Spain as sales promoters for the Group’s brands in supermarkets. Sales increased in several sales points as a result of the work of the project’s beneficiaries.


---

**Box 16: World Bank project on sexual and gender based violence (SGBV) in Papua New Guinea (PNG) – energy and mining sector**

In Papua New Guinea (PNG) levels of SGBV are some of the highest in the world and the mining centre has been a ‘flash points’ for conflict. A World Bank project consulted local women during the project identification stage of a new mining project, and found that women anticipated higher levels of violence and abuse as a result of the influx of labour. They described shifts in social dynamics due to the sudden increase in income. In response to this, a woman was appointed to represent their concerns at the negotiation table. Initially, 10% of funds from the mine’s operations were dedicated to programmes supporting women and children, and this was renegotiated to 25% in 2012, mostly due to women’s participation in negotiations.

A follow up project focused on women’s empowerment as a means to prevent SGBV. The project’s three objectives are to:

1. improve the livelihoods of women and their families;
2. institute community-based prevention practices for violence against women; and
3. assist women and adolescent girls by building their self-esteem and agency as equal contributors to community growth, and as participants in the development of mining and petroleum communities of Papua New Guinea.

The project also works with men to mitigate negative household dynamic responses. The project is supported by a trust fund, Women and Mining and Petroleum, building on a series of conferences in 2010 with the same name.

*Sources*: Menzies and Harley, 2012; World Bank, 2014; Lahiri-Dutt, 2011;
**Box 17: The Gender Equity Model (GEM) in Argentina, Colombia, Chile, Dominican Republic, Egypt, Mexico**

GEM was set up by the World Bank to promote equal opportunities for men and women and to help surmount cultural barriers in business practices. GEM projects are currently in place in Argentina, Colombia, Chile, Dominican Republic, Egypt and Mexico. The GEM is open to any company or organization and includes a focus on prompt resolution of sexual harassment complaints. When participating they are taken through four steps:

1. Identify cultural barriers and gender gaps within their organization.
2. With input from staff, prepare and implement an action plan with which to overcome these concerns.
3. An independent audit by a specialist private firm is carried out, to assess implementation,
4. A successful audit translates into a gender equitable certification, which is valid for two years.

Participating organizations claim that they have seen enhanced business performance in the form of increased productivity (as measured by workers’ performance evaluations), increased efficiency and competitiveness, due to improved management of men and women with different skills and improved internal communication within companies. Evaluations show the following successes:

- Findings from **Mexico** show that 90% of participating organizations reported that workers’ performance and productivity have increased. Measures have also been taken to improve the work-life balance of men and women alike. These include flexible hours, and the engagement of families in the company’s gender equity activities.
- GEM in **Egypt** has led to positive results predominantly in firms in the urban areas of Cairo. Gender equality training has been institutionalized, gender-sensitive HR policies and codes of conduct have been developed; and companies have advertised their commitment to the programme on their websites and in other marketing materials. Incorporation of mechanisms for addressing cases of sexual harassment and promoting a respectful working environment.
- In **Argentina** success includes a commitment to gender equality and equal opportunities now integral to many company policies and incorporation of mechanisms for addressing cases of sexual harassment and promoting a respectful working environment.

*Sources: Pungiluppi et al, 2009; Ehrenpreis et al, 2011*

---

**Box 18: The UN Global Compact**

UN Global Compact is a business and development network that brings together businesses to drive change along their supply chains. As well as encouraging companies to support women’s economic development, the UN Global Compact is also working with UN Women on initiatives promoting gender equality and zero tolerance towards violence.

The Women’s Empowerment Principles (WEPs) – a joint initiative of the UN Global Compact and UN Women – are global principles offering guidance to businesses on empowering women in the workplace, marketplace and community. The WEPs encourage employers to prioritise the safety of their female employees, both in and outside of the office.

Principle 3, *Ensure the health, safety and well-being of all women and men workers*, highlights the responsibility employers have to support victims of violence and to provide a workplace that is free from violence. There are many ways employers can fulfil this responsibility, including:

- offering services for survivors of domestic violence;
- respecting requests for time off for counselling or medical care;
- training staff to recognise the signs of violence against women;
- identifying security issues, including the safe travel of staff to and from work; and
- establishing a zero-tolerance policy towards violence and harassment at work.

Principle 7 also focuses on Measuring and publicly reporting on progress to achieve gender equality.

4.3 Evidence and lessons learned

Little is known about the impact of such interventions on the incidence of violence in the workplace, nor about the wider impact of these interventions on the social norms driving VAWG outside the work arena. Only a few businesses recognise that they can support women and girls who experience violence outside the workplace and there is no evidence on their effectiveness in reducing VAWG in the home. To impact on wider forms of violence, codes of conduct to prevent and respond to sexual abuse and harassment would need to be accompanied by an additional effort and investment to design a workplace that is truly gender friendly. This could include, for example, arrangements for childcare, provisions for paternity and maternity leave, and opportunities for women to gain support through peer networks.\(^30\)

Though strong evidence is sparse, there are factors that are common in most of the approaches found in this guidance note, and these appear to be important for success:

- **Leadership is essential.** Senior and middle managers need to be convinced of, and have the expertise to, tackle violence. These efforts must be matched and supported by internal champions and/or “change agents”. Women leaders are important in challenging gender stereotypes and giving women a voice (while recognising that women leaders do not necessarily champion women’s rights), but men also need to be involved in leading change.

- **Approaches that include union involvement or women’s organisations** need to foster a spirit of collaboration between employer and employees. Unions and worker representatives should be involved in design and implementation of the approach to tackle violence.

- **Policies, procedures, audits and systems that address violence within the workplace** and support women who have experienced violence outside of or on their way to work should consider the need to be participatory and inclusive of women, the importance of safety and confidentiality, the pre-eminence of women’s rights and safety over company profit, and the important of having links to organisations able to provide relevant services. They also need to ensure that approaches are embedded into company structures and systems (such as human resource management systems) in order to have a whole company/organisation approach.

- **Social norm change in organisations can be catalysed and promoted** through these approaches, and by using an effective internal and external communications campaign. This should be consistent with the values and approach that is integrated throughout the organisation and include media and direct communications. Direct communications can consist of workshops and internal working groups, gender awareness training, and worker mentors and buddies. As seen in the previous section (Outcome 1), there are gender transformative approaches and curricula that could be transferred into the environment of a large organisation (private or public sector).

---

**Box 19: Lessons learnt by the Fair Wear Foundation in Bangladesh**

- Modify trainings so that they are more specific to the experiences of workers in different factories.
- Much of the abusive behaviour suffered by women workers comes from male line supervisors, who are placed under enormous pressure to meet unrealistic production deadlines. Better human resources and anti-harassment training for these supervisors would help reduce behaviour like shouting, verbal sexual abuse and hitting.
- The committees – and the factory management - will need to develop linkages to external care providers to deal with more serious forms of violence that come to light.
- Foreign brands, as the customers of factories, can support efforts better through stable business relationships with suppliers.
- Other common code of conduct best practices benefit women workers. For example, brands can help to reduce excessive overtime and reduce the risks women face from working and commuting home late at night.

*Source: Fair Wear Foundation (2013)*

\(^{30}\) Scott et al, 2013
Developing a Theory of Change – Outcome 2

2. Businesses, employers, market places and associations (including trade associations, business and development networks and women’s associations) have policies, skills, partnerships and social norms to tackle VAWG (prevention, protection and response).

- Unions have an active and positive role with the private sector in preventing and addressing violence in the workplace.
- Company and market place policies, social norms and human resource management protect women from violence in the workplace.
- Employees who have experienced violence are able to receive company benefits to access appropriate services.
- Women feel safe and valued in the workplace, in markets and business associations.

Strengthened and active coalition to address VAWG in the workplace through national and international private sector and civil society. Social norms change within businesses and institutions so that violence is not accepted.

- Support unions and collective action to address VAWG and gender inequality in the workplace.
- Develop company policies and leadership promote gender equality, women’s rights, access to services and non-tolerance of VAWG.
- Strengthen human resource systems and integrate action to address VAWG including procedures for complaints and redress, rights.
- Develop a benefits system for employees to support those who have experienced violence – e.g. health, psychosocial and legal support.
- Company social norm change – Use communications and workshops to build knowledge of gender equality, rights of women and non-tolerance of discrimination and VAWG.

Advocacy and pressure from national coalitions to end VAWG in workplace and international company/ trade action to ensure VAWG in workplace is addressed both within their own value chain and also in the communities where they work. Work to change social norms.
5. Outcome Area 3: Securing political commitment, policies and laws

Note: Due to limited evidence in this area most of the examples cited in this part of the note are cases and stories rather than results of research or evaluation.

5.1 What are the challenges to be addressed?

There are multiple discriminatory laws in developing countries that limit women’s access to assets and their income earning potential, and also that sanction certain forms of violence (e.g. rape within marriage). Even where there is positive legislation and public policy, it is often not implemented. Specialist expertise is required to analyse the legal and policy frameworks and to ensure workable suggestions and technical solutions are put forward to government and legislative bodies. Civil society organisations often lead on campaigning for better women’s rights within the law, and they need to be supported to contribute to change. Particular challenges include:

- Public sector and legislative bodies may have social norms that inhibit their commitment to tackling violence.
- There is usually a lack of national research and information about VAWG in the workplace and in the world of work.
- Employers do not understand the benefits that their organisations and employees can achieve with legal and policy frameworks that protect women and girls from VAWG in public spaces, in the home and in the workplace. It is frequently believed that tighter legislation on issues such as health and safety will cost businesses, with little or no payback. Companies may believe that this might make them uncompetitive and so may resist improved rights for women and girls.
- Lack of expertise and political will in CSOs and public sector.
- Contradictions and difference in practice between national law and customary or traditional laws and practice.

5.2 Interventions

(i) **Work to change discriminatory legislation, including customary law.** To achieve economic empowerment it is crucial for women to have access to, and control over, their own assets, and freedom to choose when and where to work and whether to start their own enterprise. Examples of discriminatory laws or policies working against women include women needing husbands’ permission or signature to own land/business, and discriminatory barriers within inheritance, divorce, and child custody processes. Women should be given the power to make their own decisions. The law should, as a minimum, not inhibit this crucial aspect of women’s economic empowerment. Parliamentary quotas for women may support more women friendly legislation and policies. For example, increased representation of women in political leadership leads to a greater number of doctors in the health service and an increased percentage of women who receive prenatal care.

(ii) **Ensure there are public policies and legislation to promote equality and safety of women and girls in the workplace, in markets and in public spaces.** These public policies can be developed at a national level, or be based on international codes and agreements. Unions have called for the ILO to

---

31 Litton and Weldon, date?
32 Knack and Sanyal, 2000
set an international standard on sexual and gender based violence (SGBV) that could influence and guide countries wishing to introduce legislation. The international standard could include:

---> A broad definition of gender-based violence at work, which includes the diverse forms of violence endured by workers at their workplace.
---> Provisions to prevent gender-based violence at work.
---> Measures to protect and support workers affected by gender-based violence.
---> A description of the groups most affected by gender-based violence: women and girls (particularly adolescent girls), LGBT, Indigenous and migrant workers, workers living with HIV/AIDS and disabilities, and people trapped in forced and child labour.

Box 20: Legislation on Harassment of Women in the Workplace in Pakistan

After many years of campaigning by women activists and civil society organisations, and considerable opposition from conservative and religious groups, the Protection Against Harassment of Women at Workplace Bill was signed by Pakistan’s President Asif Ali Zardari in March 2010. It identifies three manifestations of sexual harassment in the workplace: (1) abuse of authority; (2) creating a hostile environment; and (3) retaliation after an employee refuses to grant sexual favours. The landmark law, and accompanying Code of Conduct, was endorsed by the UN Country Team in 2011, with all heads of UN agencies signing endorsement cards to express their commitment towards the implementation of the landmark law. In 2012, the federal Ombudsperson asked all government departments and private companies to display the Code of Conduct.

However, challenges remain in implementing the legislation, in particular in raising awareness of the law and changing attitudes. Although no longitudinal data on sexual harassment of women in the workplace exists in Pakistan, several studies suggest that sexual harassment continues to be a problem, especially among domestic workers, students and nurses, and may even be on the increase as more women join the workforce.

Sources: Saeed, 2012; Merkin and Kamal Sha, 2014; Cohen, 2013; Muppala, 2010; Mangi, 2011; Bolo Bhi, 2014

(iii) Simplify and adapt laws for industries and business in which women dominate and ensure they are gender sensitive. This would include regulations needed to register businesses, market regulations, the design of VATs and other taxes (prioritising products that women sell).

(iv) Introduce public policy and programmes to ensure safety on the way to work and in market places. Legislation on sexual harassment in public spaces is only enacted in 8 of the 100 economies examined in a World Bank study. Prevention measures can be incorporated into transport infrastructure design, for example through:
- Improved lighting.
- Accessibility and safety of bathrooms.
- Open designs of spaces that allow for more visibility.
- Social interventions to encourage behavioural change, such as broader public education and communications campaigns about harassment and assault on public transport, as well as training transport staff in how to respond to harassment.
- There are mixed views regarding whether segregating women on public transport is effective in reducing harassment and violence. At best it is a short term solution to protect women. In the long term, wide scale social norm change and better security would be required.

Some interventions have worked to create safer transport for women; one example is ‘pink transport’ in Mexico City, which provide female-only cars on the subway, and ‘metrobus’, widely used in practice and by a larger share of working women than the women only taxis (bright pink, 33

33 World Bank, 2013b
women-only transport for women who wish to avoid the risk of violence on public transport, particularly early in the morning or late at night.34)

**Box 21: Creating safe spaces and a safe city for women entrepreneurs in Papua New Guinea**

UN Women/AusAid’s A Safe City for Women and Girls program works to create safe and equal participation of women in local economies. In Papua New Guinea, the programme works to make the public market safer, where 55 percent of women and girls have experienced some type of violence, including rape and gang rape. Women and girls also face harassment and violence on the public transport they take to and from the market place. As a result, female market vendors frequently pay cash for “protection.” The Safe Cities project in Port Moresby plans to increase public safety for women in marketplaces through infrastructure and council policy improvements, as well as through support to women vendor associations in advocating for better services at the market, including toilets, lighting, and police protection.

Sources: Aus/AID and UN Women (2013)

(v) Time-saving legislation and action to ensure legal maternity leave and childcare, addressing unpaid care and household work. This could include the provision of infrastructure that saves women time in household duties, e.g. running water (to spend less time fetching water), supply of energy (to spend less time fetching wood) and improved sanitation (to avoid illness and lack of hygiene). It could also include policies to provide social protection for women with a heavy care and household work burden, including women who take in orphans, who care for survivors of conflict and gun crime, or for the elderly; and free or subsidised childcare for poor women (examples from Peru (Wawa wasi), Chile (Chile solidario) and Mexico (Estancias programme)).

(vi) Promote legislation that ensures VAWG issues are included in health and safety legislation and basic labour standards, including equal pay (see Box 21).

**Box 22: Law protecting homeworkers in Thailand**

HomeNet Thailand successfully campaigned for the enactment of a national law protecting homeworkers, ratified in 2010. The law provides for protection of wages – including equal pay for men and women doing the same job – as well as occupational health and safety and responsibilities of employers toward homeworkers. It also establishes a Committee for the Protection of Homeworkers on which both men and women will serve, ensuring women have a role in decision making. Between 500,000 and 2 million workers are affected by this legislation.

5.3 Evidence and lessons learned

There is little high quality evidence on the impact of legal and regulatory reform, international trade agreements, and gender-relevant legislation relevant to private sector practice on women’s economic empowerment or on VAWG. Most of the examples cited in this part of the note are cases and stories rather than results of research or evaluation. Where useful laws and policy frameworks do exist, there is often a gap in implementation, and therefore limited impact. For legislation and policy to be effective there needs to be knowledge of the conditions, programmes and services to be able to implement the laws and policies. There also needs to be political will and leadership to ensure good practice is encouraged and enhanced, and that funds are allocated from public budgets. Better research is needed to measure the impact pathways from legal, regulatory and infrastructure enhancements.

34 Dunckel-Graglia, 2013
Developing a Theory of Change: Outcome 3

3. Business and trade enabling environment (including legal and regulatory environment and physical and transport environment) does no harm, protects women and girls from violence and enables response.

- Sufficient and safe infrastructure is in place to ensure women are safe getting to work and in the marketplace (e.g., transport, lighting, guards etc.)
- Legislation, including customary law, supports women's rights to own property, assets/enterprise
- Women's business activity is facilitated through good regulation and non-regressive tax
- Women have sufficient support to work, earn and maintain reproductive and caring roles
- Equal pay and basic labour standards and safety at work in law and including in health and safety legislation

Address discriminatory legislation, including customary law (e.g., women needing husbands permission to own land/business, inheritance & divorce and child custody)
Ensure there are public policies to promote equality and safety of women and girls in the workplace, in markets and in public spaces – do no harm
Simplify and adapt laws to women’s situation – regulations needed to register businesses, market regulations also the design of VATs and other taxes (products that women sell)
Public policy and programmes to ensure safety getting to work and in markets – safe cities (UNWomen eg), safe markets (e.g., PNG), safe outdoor spaces.
Time saving legislation and legal maternity leave and childcare etc addressing unpaid care and household work
Promote legislation that ensures VAWG issues are included in health and safety legislation and basic labour standards, including equal pay
6. Cost-benefit and VfM analysis

Value for money (VfM) analysis is essential for all UK funding, though analysis in this sector is challenging. The most challenging part of undertaking a VfM analysis is the measurement of impact on violence incidence and rates.\(^{35}\) Typically programmes working to tackle VAWG may see a rise in reported rates of violence in the short to medium term due to increased reporting and an increase in women’s and girls’ awareness of their rights. Incidence may actually increase if a backlash results in more VAWG. Another challenge, which is common to many programmes, is in ensuring that VfM analysis does not lead to an increased instrumentalist approach and an undervaluing of the human rights and wellbeing benefits of addressing VAWG.

Value for money analysis of VAWG/economic development programmes could involve:

(i) Cost benefit analysis - including
   - Net present value of benefits that have been monetized.
   - Analysis of programme cost by benefit area
   - Cost per benefit

(ii) Measures of overall costs and public money saved by the programme

(iii) Measures of improvements in productivity or business profitability

(iv) Measures of personal individual benefit (including savings of costs associated with violence, increase in income/profit, increase in ownership of assets)

(i) Cost benefit analysis

Define your unit of benefit – for example:

- Number of women or girls who have been saved from experiencing violence by the programme (calculated by using the reduction in VAWG across the population). This will only be possible if prevalence surveys are possible and reliable.
- Number of women and girls who have increased economic empowerment
- Number of women owning land or other fixed assets
- Increased profitability of women owned businesses
- DALY\(^{36}\) and QALY\(^{37}\) saved benefits

It is important to list all of the benefits, whether they can be expressed in terms of economic units or not, and then choose to monetise only those that can be. The other benefits should also be expressed in the VfM analysis as those that cannot be measured in the same way.

If it exists (usually WHO or World Bank), it may be possible to extrapolate from the overall cost to the country GDP and the national VAWG prevalence rate to calculate how much each case is costing the country. If this information does not exist, programmes may want to consider undertaking some preliminary research to obtain this data. Useful methodology for doing this can be found in the UK and Australia.\(^{38}\) This information will also serve to inform policy makers and possibly increase political will to tackle VAWG.

---

\(^{35}\) See the What works to prevent VAWG website for more on this: http://www.whatworks.co.za/

\(^{36}\) Disability-adjusted life year - A measure of the impact of a disease or injury in terms of healthy years lost.

\(^{37}\) Quality-adjusted life year - A measure of the state of health of a person or group in which the benefits, in terms of length of life, are adjusted to reflect the quality of life. One QALY is equal to 1 year of life in perfect health. QALYs are calculated by estimating the years of life remaining for a patient following a particular treatment or intervention and weighting each year with a quality of life score (on a zero to 1 scale). It is often measured in terms of the person's ability to perform the activities of daily life, freedom from pain and mental disturbance.

\(^{38}\) The DFID Research programme: What Works to Prevent Violence against Women and Girls’ programme, Component 3 (2014-2018) will generate new methodologies for determining the economic and social costs of VAWG
Using the projected number of VAWG cases prevented per year, calculate the net present value (NPV) of the savings over the lifetime of the programme – though you may also want to calculate this for the time period that the projected benefits are forecast to take place beyond the end of the programme.

You can also calculate the cost per benefit. This requires a thorough understanding of the cost that the programme incurs in order to achieve the chosen benefit. Accounting methods need to be set up at the beginning of a programme in order to be able to produce this type of information.

**(ii) Measures of overall costs and public money saved by the programme**

Estimates of the costs of VAWG have used diverse methodologies and consider a number of different factors. In all cases, even when estimates generate different figures, they indicate significant costs across a number of factors. The focus of the analysis presented in this note is on lost individual and aggregate level income, in terms of work and productivity lost and losses on business profit. These same losses also have significant short and long term costs on survivors’ economic and productive capacity and wellbeing, accruing to significant costs to the individual and the economy.

Although there is no right way to measure the economic impact of violence, studies usually examine costs in terms of prevention, response and opportunity costs, and may cover costs linked to an increased burden on law enforcement structures, costs linked to the judiciary (civil, criminal and administrative), legal costs incurred by individual parties, health care costs, housing and shelters, lost wages and/or decrease in taxes paid to the state due to reduced employment and productivity, social services for women and their children, income support and other support services. In addition, many studies distinguish between direct and indirect costs of violence against women. Most of these types of calculations have been made in high income countries, where a range of services are available. In low income countries, some of these costs would not actually be incurred as many of the services are not available or would not be used by those with few resources.

Different approaches are used to calculate the cost of violence in terms of GDP loss. For example:

- cost of services - study on costs in terms of health care in the USA - 42% higher for survivors, but does not include long-term costs
- foregone income from women and their families
- decreased productivity
- negative effect on human capital formation

A 2004 Australian study used estimates of productivity-related costs including:

- reduced productivity of the victim;
- absenteeism of the victim, perpetrator and family members;
- costs of replacing lost output through overtime by other workers;
- reduced productivity of the victim’s and perpetrator’s co-workers and friends and family;
- additional administrative costs of employers; loss of unpaid household and voluntary work by the victim, perpetrator, and family and friends; and
- cost to the health system – treatment, risk behaviour including risky sexual behaviour (which might lead to unintended pregnancies, unsafe abortion, HIV and STI infection) and drug abuse.

Other significant costs of violence to the health system include those related to depression, smoking, obesity, high-risk sexual behaviours, unintended pregnancy, and alcohol abuse, the incidence of

---

39 Somach and AbouZeid, 2009  
40 Council of Europe, 2012  
41 Klugman et al, 2014  
42 Access Economics, 2004
which have been linked to violence.\textsuperscript{43} It is important to list these costs even if all cannot be monetised in order to avoid a reductionist analysis.

(iii) Measures of effects on productivity or business profitability

There is evidence that VAWG has an impact on business profitability through employee productivity and other aspects of poor performance. Willman\textsuperscript{44} looks at different frameworks for analysing costs. Specific cost categories for the cost of GBV to business vary by study but can be broadly grouped into three major elements:\textsuperscript{45}

- Output loss due to increased absenteeism
- Output loss due to decreased productivity
- Expenditure on provision of services.

These types of measures have been used in larger and formal sector companies, however they could also be used for measuring the same for micro or small enterprises owned by women and girls or sole traders. A calculation of the loss of income and profits to MSMEs due to VAWG may be possible.

(iv) Measures of personal individual benefit (including savings of costs associated with violence, increase in income/profit, increase in ownership of assets)

Women and families experience lost income and increased costs due to VAWG. These include:

- Lost income from missing work (both men and women) or losing a job
- Replacement of assets / broken household items
- Out of pocket expenditure on health and other services (e.g. legal services)

A measure of these losses can be included into the overall cost benefit analysis.

Further information on cost calculations can be found in Annex 2.

\textsuperscript{43} Violence Prevention Alliance and Education Development Center, 2011
\textsuperscript{44} Willman, 2009
\textsuperscript{45} Duvvury et al., 2004
Annex 1: Examples of indicators by outcome and output for monitoring and evaluation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcome/ output</th>
<th>Sample indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Outcome 1**: Women and girls have assets, income, skills and power to protect them from violence. (Women’s and girls’ economic empowerment increases as a vehicle and pathway to tackling VAWG) | • Prevalence and incidence of VAWG  
• Number of women and girls reporting violence  
• Number and % of couples who make decisions jointly  
• Women who own fixed assets such as land and equipment (number of women and total value of assets)  
• Women’s and girls’ income – increase and control over  
• Women’s and girls’ decision making power in home, in markets, in associations |
| **Output 1.1**  
Women and girls use financial services | • Value of savings and loans to women and girls  
• Repayment rates of loans  
• Number and % of women and girls who have access to a range of financial services  
• Women’s and girls’ financial literacy  
• Financial products that are designed for improved women and girls access and use  
• Number and % of couples who make joint financial decisions  
• Women and girls who know about their rights |
| **Output 1.2**  
Women and girls have quality and safe employment | • Women and girls who have quality employment in the formal sector  
• Level of skills and capacity in relevant economic sectors  
• Women’s and girls’ self esteem and confidence  
• Number of trained women and girls accessing employment opportunities  
• Number of women and girls reporting violence in the workplace or on the way to work |
| **Output 1.3**  
Women are supported by networks and associations | • Quality of networks and associations supporting women’s and girls’ economic empowerment and prevention of violence  
• Women’s collective action, including unions, effectively protect women from violence in the workplace  
• Ratio of men/women holding leadership positions in producer associations |
| Output 1.4 | Number of women/girls increasing enterprise income and demonstrating vertical growth/expansion  
|           | Increases in women entrepreneurs with good business and financial plans in place  
|           | Women’s enterprises that protect women from violence  
| **Outcome 2: Business, markets and associations (including women’s associations) have policies, skills, partnerships and norms to address VAWG (prevention, protection and response)** |  
| **Outcome 2 indicators** | Organisational policies are in place and implemented to tackle VAWG  
|           | Number and quality of partners that have been identified for referral or internal organisational development to tackle VAWG  
|           | Employees know the VAWG policy and are committed to its implementation  
|           | Level of gender equality improves across a range of 5 indicators (identified through an internal participatory process)  
| **Output 2.1** | Unions and companies are working together to prevent and address VAWG  
| Union work with private sector to tackle VAWG | Women employees know their rights and who in the union or company to communicate with over VAWG issues  
| **Output 2.2** | Complaint and redress system is functioning well  
| Company and market place social norms protect women from violence | Women are able to access complaints system confidentially  
|           | Number of people in the workplace who think VAWG is acceptable  
|           | Company leadership demonstrate commitment to end VAWG  
| **Output 2.3** | Women can access services through employer benefits and referral scheme  
| Women supported by employer | Women who have experienced violence who are physically and psychologically prepared for work  
| **Output 2.4** | Number of women who have an increased sense of security  
| Women feel safe and valued in the workplace, market places and business | Number of women who are not scared of travelling to work or being in the workplace |
Outcome 3: Business and trade enabling environment (including legal and regulatory environment and physical and transport environment) does no harm, protects women and girls from violence and enables response

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcome 3 indicators</th>
<th>• Laws and regulation changes that increase safety and security of women in the workplace, in markets and in public spaces</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Output 3.1</td>
<td>• Safe transport scheme • Lighting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure in place to ensure women are safe getting to work and in the marketplace</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Output 3.2</td>
<td>• Number of women and girls have improved legal rights to own property, assets and enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legislation supports women’s rights</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Output 3.3</td>
<td>• Number of women and girls owned enterprises that are able to register and that save taxes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women’s business activity is facilitates through good regulation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Output 3.4</td>
<td>• Number of women and girls who have more time to spend training, earning an income and enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women have time and support to work and earn an income</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Output 3.5</td>
<td>• % difference between women’s and men’s pay for same jobs • Labour standards and health and safety regulations that include VAWG considerations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal pay and basic labour standards protect women from violence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Box 23: Tool for the measurement, assessment, and monitoring of changes in attitudes toward social norms affecting GBV

The “Gender Equitable Men Scale” developed by the Population Council, PATH, and Instituto Promundo. The scale provides psychometric evaluation of change in attitudes towards gender norms, including those related to GBV, over time when repeated at least twice over the course of a project. It can be adapted to the local context and has been tested and applied in Brazil, China, Ethiopia, India, Kenya, Tanzania, and Uganda. Findings suggest the scale has good predictive validity for partner violence and other domains such as contraceptive use and multiple sexual partners.

Sample survey items in the partner violence domain:

- There are times when a woman deserves to be beaten.
- A woman should tolerate violence to keep her family together.
- It is alright for a man to beat his wife if she is unfaithful.
- A man can hit his wife if she won’t have sex with him.
- If someone insults a man, he should defend his reputation with force if he has to.
- A man using violence against his wife is a private matter that shouldn’t be discussed outside the couple.

Source: Nanda, Geeta. 2011.

Resources for defining indicators:

- [https://www.globalreporting.org/resourcelibrary/Embedding-Gender-In-Sustainability-Reporting-Executive-Summary.pdf](https://www.globalreporting.org/resourcelibrary/Embedding-Gender-In-Sustainability-Reporting-Executive-Summary.pdf)
- Violence Against Women and Girls: A Compendium of Monitoring and Evaluation Indicators.
- GBVIMS - [Gender-Based Violence Information Management System (GBVIMS)](http://www.gbvims.com/get-the-gbvims/)
Annex 2: Data for costing VAWG

There are some national level surveys and data collected on VAWG, particularly in developed countries which enables more detailed estimates of the direct and direct costs it generates, as much of the analysis presented above indicates. However, while international surveys do exist, they have yet to be standardised and widely implemented. Willman (2009) explains that the longest-standing and most widely implemented survey on domestic violence is the Demographic and Health Surveys (DHS) Domestic Violence Module. These surveys have been collecting data on prevalence of domestic violence within households in the early 1990s, and by the end of the decade had developed a standard module that has now been implemented in 17 developing countries, some multiple times.

A second international data source is the World Health Organization (WHO) Multicountry Study on Domestic Violence and Women’s Health. This survey has been implemented in 11 developing countries and collects data on prevalence and health outcomes of domestic violence, although not on related services and their costs (WHO 2005).

The International Crime Victim Survey (ICVS) series collects data on sexual assault and assault by intimate partners. Although the questions are not extensive, they offer a basis for computing prevalence rates and defining relevant services to include in costing exercises for a representative sample. To date, the ICVS has been implemented in 70 countries, but only a small number of these are developing countries, and in these, the survey has only been implemented in capital cities.

The literature on costing domestic violence has produced widely different estimates on its impact, even when analyzing it in the same context. These differences result from different objectives, methodologies, and categories of costs included in the estimations.

Costing methodologies

Duvvury et al (2013) explains that while the methodologies for estimating economic costs are in the process of being continuously refined, several meta reviews of costing studies (Duvvury, et al. 2004; Morrison and Orlando 2004; Day, et al. 2005; and Willman 2009) indicate that most studies use five distinct approaches or methodologies. This synthesis draws on Duvvury et al’s (2013) analysis of costing methodologies for intimate partner violence, which is applicable to other forms of VAWG. An important conclusion emerging from this overview of methodologies is that the data requirements for the various methodologies vary significantly:

1) Direct accounting methodology: Focuses on establishing a unit cost either through a bottom-up (based on detailed costs for providing a service) or top-down proportional approach (derived from an annual budget). The accounting methodology is used across service provision sectors for an aggregate cost of preventing and responding to violence. It is also used for establishing foregone income and requires data on prevalence of IPV, number of incidents experienced in a year, days lost per incident, and average wage.

Accounting methodology is a core methodology used in most studies to establish direct cost of service provision. For example, the 2004 Access Economics study, establishes utilization rate of services (health, police, court), calculates unit cost of service provision including capital cost, salary cost and raw material cost, and applies a national prevalence rate to get costs for each service.

Greaves, et al. on the other hand applied unit cost of services from other studies in the absence of detailed information. When detailed unit cost data for services are unavailable, another approach is to estimate the fraction attributable to IPV along with IPV exposure of individuals (prevalence rate) and apply to regression model of total expenditures to establish the increase in annual costs of the
specific service due to IPV. The regression technique has been applied particularly in the case of medical expenditures (see Chan and Cho 2010).

In terms of foregone income, a study by Center for Disease Control (2003) calculated the impact on work by establishing the incidents resulting in missed paid work and household work and applying average number of days missed to estimate the total person days lost. The total person days lost is multiplied by mean daily wage rate to estimate the monetary cost of missed work.

An advantage of the accounting methodology is that it is straightforward and less data intensive than other methods. It is most often useful to establish a quick rough estimate based on available data and simple assumptions. Another advantage is that it can establish opportunity costs at the household level, which can be a powerful demonstration to communities of the impact of violence. A limitation of this method is that it requires primary data, which is often not available, particularly in developing countries. Another disadvantage is that timeframes may not be consistent when data depends on unit costs from other studies. Additionally, it is not possible to capture long-term costs, which may lead to double counting. The interpretation of the costs of direct provision is also problematic. Increases in the cost of service provision may be a reflection of effective response by government and NGOs, leading to increased use of services, which is highlighted in the case of poorer countries which such services are not provided and therefore the ‘direct costs’ could be accounted as lower, even when prevalence rates might be higher. This highlights that service provision costs need not linearly increase with increased prevalence/incidence rate of IPV.

2) Present value of lifetime earnings approach: Using a human capital framework, an econometric methodology is used to measure the indirect costs in terms of lost productivity and lost time in the labor market due to IPV. The specific costs estimated by various studies include the lost productivity due to IPV; the loss to due to premature mortality; and loss due to disability. For example, loss due to pre-mature mortality is estimated using regression analysis to establish the present value of lifetime earnings (PVLE). This method has been used by several studies including Greave, et al. (1995) for Canada, Miller, et al. (1996) for the United States, and Walby (2004) for the United Kingdom. Estimates of impact on labor-force participation and earnings due to IPV are based on a reduced earnings equation that includes along with a standard variable for earnings and indicators for IPV (Morrison and Orlando 1999; Vyas 2013). Very often there is simultaneity problem in that earnings may impact on probability of experiencing violence, and the impacts of violence on earnings. This is usually addressed by using an instrumental variable approach, or including a variable that is related to violence but not labor force participation or earnings. This method requires data on working life trajectories, micro data sets with standard labor force information on women’s participation, working hours, and earnings. A problem with this method is that simultaneity is often not addressed so the causal direction cannot be ascertained and a robust instrumental variable is usually difficult to identify.

The limitation of present value of lifetime earnings approach is that most need adequate sample size and significant amount of detailed data on macro variables that may or may not be routinely or systematically collected. As mentioned, another limitation is that econometric approach cannot address the causality issue. Also the econometric approach can be useful in estimating some costs but not all costs associated with IPV.

3) Propensity score matching (PSM): This falls broadly under the econometric methodology but stands out in that it is a nonparametric approach used to establish the social and health impacts of IPV. The method involves estimating a probit equation of risk factors for violence, matches women victimized and those not victimized and compares some outcome measure for the two groups such as wages, for example. It is more rigorous than a simple comparison of means as women in the two samples are matched in terms of probability of violence. The PSM method has been used to
estimate the impacts of IPV on employment, earnings, on children, and on health costs. For example in Colombia, using PSM method, Ribero and Sanchez (2004) found that women experiencing violence had 8 percent higher unemployment rates than non-abused women. Morrison and Orlando (2004) applied the PSM methodology to Demographic and Health datasets that had data on prevalence of violence, different measures of child health, children’s education, women’s reproductive health outcome, women’s mental health to estimate the impacts of IPV on women’s health, earnings, employment, and child health.

The limitation of PSM is that it requires large samples to have meaningfully matched groups for comparison. The method is limited in that it cannot be used to calculate all the different cost categories of IPV as the method is focused on outcomes.

4) Willingness-to-pay or -accept/contingent value methodology. This methodology has been used to estimate the direct intangible cost of long-term pain and suffering. The willingness-to-pay estimates are based on values that workers (or consumers) place on small risks of injury or death, whereas “willingness-to-accept” estimates are based on actual jury awards for identified individuals who were injured. The latter method has been used in high-income market economies with developed jurisprudence on damages in road accidents, medical malpractice, and so on. Walby (2004), for example, applied the willingness to pay estimates determined by the UK Department of Transport in terms of reducing the risk of suffering injuries and fatalities from automobile accidents, drawing on work developed by Brand and Price (2000), which estimated the willingness-to-pay to avoid certain types of violent crimes. Essentially, she matched injuries and trauma from domestic violence including rape and stalking to the common crimes listed by Brand and Price and applied their estimates of willingness-to-pay to estimate the monetary cost of pain and suffering due to domestic violence. Miller et al. (1996) used jury awards to determine the willingness to accept compensation for pain suffering and loss of quality of life due to fatal and non-fatal outcomes.

The limitation of both the willingness-to-pay and willingness-to-accept is that both require significant data and make assumptions regarding the similarity of duration and intensity of trauma from IPV and other violent crimes. Given the lack of willingness-to-pay or accept surveys focused on IPV, studies using methodologies make assumptions about comparability of risk. And the application of the methodology is limited in many developing countries given the normalization of violence as a socially accepted phenomenon and where market-based valuation of life, i.e. life and other types of health insurance are undeveloped, is not the norm.

5) Disability adjusted life years (DALYs): A methodology used in health economics, DALYs measure the years of life “lost” due to death, disability, and chronic morbidity. It is particularly useful to establish the health burden of IPV relative to other health conditions such as heart conditions, cancer, etc. For example, a study in Mexico City indicated that IPV was the third most important source of DALYs for women (Lozano 1999). A study in Australia suggested that, for women aged 15 to 44, IPV was a leading contributor to death, disability, and morbidity (VicHealth 2004).

The issue with DALYs is the lack of any systematic method to translate them into monetary costs. Access Economics (2004) used a method of deriving the value of a life year ascribing value to statistical life and applying this to disability adjusted life years to convert DALYs into dollar terms. The limitation of this methodology is similar to that of the willingness-to-pay/accept methodologies in that it is extremely data intensive and methodologically complex.
References


Aus/AID and UN Women (2013) *A safe place: AusAID’s support to end violence against women*


Cohen, R. (2013) cites the Pakistan’s *Daily Times*, ‘Sexual Harassment In Pakistan Is Increasing Despite The “Protection Against Harassment of Women at Work Place Act 2010.”’


Council of Europe (2012) *Overview of studies on the costs of violence against women and domestic violence*. Gender Equality and Violence against Women Division, Directorate General of Human Rights and Rule of Law


Fair Wear Foundation (2013) Standing Form On Factory Floor Harassment: preventing violence against women garment workers in Bangladesh and India. UN Women and Government of the Netherlands


Kelly et al, (2014). Resources and resourcefulness: Roles, opportunities and risks for women working at artisanal mines in South Kivu, Democratic Republic of the Congo. Futures.


Lahiri-Dutt, K. (ed) (2011) Gendering the Field Towards Sustainable Livelihoods for Mining Communities. The Australian National University


Scott et al (2013) Effectiveness of Walmart's ‘Empowering Women Together’ initiative to be evaluated


World Health Organization, the South African Medical Research Council and the London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine, (2013) Global and regional estimates of violence against women:
prevalence and health effects of intimate partner violence and non-partner sexual violence. Geneva: WHO

**Websites:**

  [https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/bitstream/handle/10986/16733/832090WP0sexua0Box0382076800PUBLIC0.pdf?sequence=1](https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/bitstream/handle/10986/16733/832090WP0sexua0Box0382076800PUBLIC0.pdf?sequence=1)

**Pers comms:**

Jo Morris, Fair Wear Foundation, October 2014

The Open Society Foundations project officer, October 2014

Mama Cash Staff, October 2014