Notes: UKCCIS Executive Board
June 2015, 14:00 – 15:30
Ministerial Conference Room, Home Office
Chair: Edward Timpson, MP

Attendees:

Edward Timpson, MP	Minister of State for Children and Families
Karen Bradley, MP	Minister for Preventing Abuse and Exploitation
Baroness Joanna Shields	Minister for Internet Safety and Security
Julian Ashworth	BT
Emilie Boman	Virgin Media
David Austin	BBFC
Will Gardner	Safer Internet Centre
Zoe Hilton	CEOP
Katie O'Donovan	Google
Susie Hargreaves	IWF
Nicola Hodson	Microsoft
Aleyne Johnson	Samsung
Adam Kinsley	BskyB
Dave Miles	FOSI
Rishi Saha	Facebook
Claudio Pollack	Ofcom
Catherine Duggan	Scottish Executive
Graham Dunn	Vodafone
Vicki Shotbolt	Parentzone
Jo Twist	UKIE
Iain Wood	TalkTalk
Peter Wanless	NSPCC
Andrea Parola	ICT Coalition
Rachel O'Connell	Trust Elevate (Age Verification Working Group Chair)
Anna Payne	UKCCIS Secretariat

Apologies received from:

Dr Sonia Livingstone	LSE
John Carr	CHIS
Tink Palmer	Marie Collins Foundations

Observers:

Silvia Fukuoka	Ofcom	Anna Strudwick	Home Office
Claire Thwaites	Apple	Sean McGarry	Home Office
Sam Sharps	Apple	Ellie Mond	DCMS
Emma Ascroft	Yahoo	Samantha Kelly	DCMS
Nick Pickles	Twitter	Pete McDougall	DCMS
Rebecca Cavilla	Department of Health	Alice Miles	DfE
Claire Lilley	NSPCC	Jason Morris	DfE
Michael Bell	DfE	Isabel Evans	DfE
Saskia Bradbury	DCMS		

Item 1 - Welcome, introductions, apologies and declaring interests

1. The Chair opened the meeting and welcomed new Ministerial co-Chairs Baroness Joanna Shields from DCMS and Karen Bradley, MP from the Home Office.
2. The Chair welcomed guests and observers. He reminded Board members of their responsibilities and to declare any interests.
3. He asked if the Board were content to approve Rishi Saha as the Facebook representative – no objections were given. He also noted that Katie O'Donovan was attending in the stead of Naomi Gummer from Google, and suggested that the Board also approve Katie as the permanent member - no objections were given.
4. The Chair asked the Board to give feedback to the Secretariat about how membership can best support the objectives of UKCCIS.
5. The proposed date of the next meeting is 8 September to be chaired by Karen Bradley.
6. Karen Bradley outlined her role as Minister for Preventing Abuse and Exploitation and MP for Staffordshire Moorlands. Following a rejig of Ministerial portfolios at the Home Office, safeguarding, vulnerable people, antisocial behaviour and gangs, mental health, modern slavery and child abuse/exploitation all fall within her remit. It will be useful to consider these issues in the round and learn from what works across the different areas. She stated that we're facing an ever more complicated challenge at UKCCIS, and that we need to ensure that young people are protected and we're ahead of the game.
7. Baroness Shields introduced herself and said that she had worked with many members in her years representing technology platforms. This newly created role is recognition by the Prime Minister that we need a dedicated team to liaise with industry and law enforcement to ensure that children are safe and can benefit from the internet. WeProtect has led the world in tackling online CSE and CSA. This was an excellent model of cooperation between government, industry and NGOs that she hoped to continue. Her role will cover online extremism, child safety and child sexual exploitation. It is a new role, which is still being defined.
8. The Chair re-emphasised that Government is keen to work together with industry in a constructive and collaborative way, but reserves the right to use legislative instruments if necessary to safeguard children.
9. Executive Board members and observers then introduced themselves in turn and gave some background about their involvement with UKCCIS.

Item 2 – Social Media Working Group and ICT Coalition Principles

10. Claudio Pollack gave an update on the Social Media working group, which Minister Ed Vaizey had asked Ofcom to lead. The group is taking a broad definition of 'social media' to include all services where people engage online.
11. In order to address the global nature of these issues, it was decided to use the ICT coalition principles as a basis for the project. Their scope is cross-European and encompasses more than social media, and have industry backing.

12. The working group is producing guidance drawing on best practice and considering how best to present this. The group is focusing on a programme of outreach to smaller and more niche companies who might not automatically build child protection into the development of new social media platforms.
13. The group has met three times and a number of the document champions are around the table today.
14. Claudio introduced Andrea Parola from the ICT Coalition Children Online which is made up of 23 companies and covers various different online sectors. The aim is to make the internet a better and safer place for children. The companies adopted a set of principles in 2012 and engaged with the European Commission to present the work done by industry and to avoid duplication. The Coalition meets every six months in Brussels.
15. The Coalition is working on a white paper which outlines possible threats from the internet and what can be done, by industry, NGOs and public authorities. The report will be presented at the next meeting on 30th June in Brussels – the meeting is open to all and free of charge.
16. The internet is a great tool which involves some danger. Just as you don't leave 6 or 7 year olds alone in the park, you don't leave them alone on the internet. Need to provide education and tools for parents and educators who should play an active role. The ICT Coalition strongly believes that self-regulation is important and it is working with the European Commission for a common approach and to maintain self regulation in this area.
17. Claudio mentioned that the working group aims to produce guidance in November that is relevant and has tangible, real benefits. Input and feedback is welcomed.
18. Discussion followed and the following points were raised:
    ● There is a fundamental question about whether self-regulation is quick enough to protect children from danger online. The NSPCC wrote to Baroness Shields about a video of a screaming baby being dunked into water on Facebook. Concerned that there is a clear and agreed approach to sexual abuse, but not to physical or emotional abuse. The NSPCC is anxious to see quicker progress and asked if the time is right for stronger regulation or legislation to enable social media providers to do the right thing for children.
    ● BT is against new regulation on the internet, but there are issues with encrypted social media and how ISP tools and filters can address this. They would like to focus on addressing this over the year.
    ● When faced with new threats and new trends, self-regulation can sometimes be stronger and quicker if it is done well.
    ● Facebook want to be an active participant in difficult cases like this. They need to make decisions and identify priorities when looking at content. With child sexual exploitation, every aspect of the content is illegal (its production, hosting, downloading, viewing). When content depicts an illegal act, it can be used by law enforcement to bring perpetrators to justice. Facebook has a difficult call to make. That's why conversations and effective self-regulatory channels are so important. For instance they have a dedicated email which provides a direct channel for NGOs and others to inform Facebook and offer additional context about inappropriate content. That dialogue is essential. Facebook has 1.4 billion

customers and may not get it right for everyone all the time. But it is important that people can share challenging views on the platform - sometimes it is only place where things can be debated openly. Where is the best forum to have these debates about pieces of content on social networks – in a private forum such as UKCCIS or publically in the media?

19. Baroness Shields thanked the NSPCC for raising this important issue. Sometimes it is painful for such issues to be raised in public but sometimes this can be the spark that makes us recognise that we need to work together as industry and Government.

20. There is a strong pull between self-regulation and the idea that we can solve everything through legislation.

21. There has been great progress on CSE – for instance on search engines and hash sets. It took some playing out in the public domain for us to get to that point. UKCCIS is hopefully the sort of group that allows us to address these issues before they get into the public domain. Baroness Shields used to work for Facebook and is aware that there are sometimes tensions between free speech and online safety.

22. Our first concern is: where is the child in the video, who's looking after them, how do we find them? In Baroness Shields' view there is no value in the information being shared and it's not about protecting rights if it's showing an illegal act. The solution lies in companies in this room – we need to find different solutions for different platforms. This is a healthy forum and can be used to address these issues as part of a working group, rather than in public.

23. The Chair agreed with Baroness Shields' articulation of how to move forwards. The social media guidelines work will help us to take stock on these matters. The Chair asked for this discussion to be brought back onto the agenda in September and to see what can be accomplished in the meantime.

24. Facebook stated that they would welcome the chance to work directly with the NSPCC to understand and work out differences of opinion.

25. Other comments:
   - With CSE, there are no grey areas, no margins. Other illegal acts should fall into the same category.
   - Need bring focus back to victims - where clear child abuse images exist, victimisation continues. Material does not need to be kept up for law enforcement to act.
   - The letter from the NSPCC implied that social media wasn't at the forefront of tackling CSE, but Facebook and Twitter are actually right up there and front of place.

26. The Chair agreed that there was more work to do and a constructive way to move forward, including through the social media working group.

An update on progress will be provided at September's Executive Board meeting.

Item 3 – Update from Working Groups

27. The Chair invited the other working groups to provide updates.

28. Dave Miles gave an update for the filters working group. It was established on 6th March following the strategic review and agreed at the Executive Board. Terms of reference were agreed at the April meeting and are on the

UKCCIS website. The group's inaugural meeting was on 30 April and the group will hold quarterly meetings and provide verbal reports to the Board.

29. The overall aim of the working group is to consolidate into one group those UKCCIS stakeholder organisations that have been tasked with deploying family-friendly network level filtering. Eight sector leads / experts have been appointed, including representatives from ISPs, public Wi-Fi, youth charities. Bringing these platform providers together reveals some important and untold success stories. For instance the RDI Friendly Wi-Fi scheme is being used in Singapore, Norway, and Seattle. The group will continue to address overblocking concerns, it will also look at implications of browser encryption and circumvention, and track requirements across new and emerging technology, including internet TV, connected cars and the internet of things. The group is watching developments around EU net neutrality regulations. The UK is widely acknowledged as a leader in this area, and the group should be looked on as a centre of excellence.

30. The Chair mentioned the on-going net neutrality discussions in Europe and said that DCMS officials were on-hand to answer any questions. The Government does not want to compromise our policies, our approach or emerging technologies. As the final text comes out, we will share it with the Board.

31. Dave Miles gave an update about the evidence working group on behalf of Sonia Livingstone, the Board's Evidence Champion. Following the strategic review, the group has reviewed its terms of reference and these are now available on the UKCCIS website. The group aims to provide UKCCIS with a timely, critical and rigorous account of relevant national and international research; to identify and review new research relevant to child internet safety and online child abuse; and to provide research expertise in key areas. Membership has been restructured to include both core and associate members, so a wider group of academics can be drawn on for specific issues. The group is looking at success indicators – for instance annual metrics on safety risk - and would welcome steers as the project develops. More than 80 research highlights are on the Safer Internet Centre website - FOSI tracks these and uploads them onto its website - the group would welcome others linking to the site as well. The evidence group is widely acknowledged as centre of excellence and the specialist seminars they put on are outstanding and well worthwhile.

32. Rachel O'Connell gave an update from the age verification working group. The Digital Policy Alliance (DPA), a neutral cross-party group, looks at the implications of legislation on UK businesses. The DPA formed an age verification group in November, bringing together different sectors. It is considering things such as the Audio-Visual Media Services directive, tobacco regulation, single European payments, and the framework around eIDAS regulation. The DPA are trying to ensure that the UK has solutions and effective options available around age verification. One of the biggest adult providers – Mindgeek – have agreed publically to implement age verification on their platforms. The ICM registry (which operates the .xxx domain registry) has also agreed to implement. The key is that this is a federated solution - verify once, use many times.

33. Rachel is arranging a symposium to educate and inform people about what's been happening. The date will be confirmed soon. Don Thibeau, Pat Manson and Andrea Servida have agreed to speak. Government is developing ways for citizens to use eID to interact with government services, and Rachel is now looking at how to roll this out to the commercial sector. The event will be sponsored by Equifax, as well as Timpson's (who are developing in-store solutions for people who aren't able to verify online). The traditional blockages to age verification for children are no longer in place. Ministerial and executive level support is needed to push this forward e.g. could schools' logins be tokenised and used in a wider context, without disclosing privacy? At the last UKCCIS meeting, it was agreed that the Secretariat would carry out a cross-departmental review of which Departments have an interest here, including what the legal framework is and how can we leverage it to deliver solutions. The Secretariat is in touch with the DPA to support their work.

> Rachel to send DPA data to UKCCIS members once it's pinned down.

34. The Chair said that UKCCIS has heard the evolution of this work, and it sounds that technical integration has become more and more apparent. The Chair confirmed that the UKCCIS forum could be a useful contributor to the manifesto commitment to age verify adult sites and ensure it is as dynamic as possible. Want to pull on expertise, rather than it being a top down approach. Baroness Shields said that we are open to ideas and want to ensure the highest level of success. We are working on policy now, so please feed in thoughts.

35. Zoe Hilton spoke on behalf of the Education working group. Draft terms of reference have been developed and they will be circulated to UKCCIS. Aims include mapping the current internet safety landscape in schools and other education settings, and looking at areas where supplementary guidance would be useful.

Item 4 – Any Other Business

36. The Board approved applications for associate membership from Barnardo's and the RDI.

37. Karen Bradley gave an update about WeProtect – since the summit in December last year, Government has been working with internet partners to follow up actions. CEOP's work on the database of images is very promising. The UK is at the forefront of efforts to tackle CSE, we need to make sure the international community is involved and ensure good attendance at the next summit in Abu Dhabi.

38. Baroness Shields added that lots of work has gone into domestic efforts and that we would be working with UNICEF to ensure other countries can benefit from the progress being made.

39. The IWF asked for clarification about the £50 million fund that UNICEF is managing. Karen Bradley said that £10 million is just for the first year, and assured members that online CSE will be a prominent and sustained part of the work.

40. The Chair asked members to suggest future agenda items to the Secretariat. It was suggested that a further update on Internet Matters would be useful, alongside items on WeProtect and Social Media.
41. It was suggested that representatives from the devolved administrations be invited to all meetings.
42. It was suggested that the App Developers Alliance be invited to the next meeting to discuss their work.