

Notes: UKCCIS Executive Board
04 December 2014, 14:30-16:00
Committee Room 16, Palace of Westminster
Chair: Mike Penning, MP

Attendees:

Mike Penning, MP (Chair)	Minister of State for Policing, Criminal Justice and Victims
Edward Timpson, MP	Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State for Children and Families
Claudio Pollack	Director Consumer Group, Ofcom
Susie Hargreaves, Daniel Wood	CEO, Internet Watch Foundation (IWF) UKIE (in place of Jo Twist)
Daniel Butler	Head of Public Affairs, Virgin Media
Adam Kinsley	Director of Policy, Sky, BskyB
Julian Ashworth, Vicki Shotbolt	Chief Strategy Officer, BT CEO, Parentzone
Rishi Saha	Facebook (in place of Simon Milner)
John Carr	CHIS
Dave Miles	FOSI
David Cooke	Director, BBFC
Will Gardner	CEO, Safer Internet Centre
Tink Palmer	Marie Collins Foundation
Claire Lilley	NSPCC (in place of Peter Liver)
Becky Foreman	Microsoft (in place of Nicola Hodson)
Naomi Gummer	Public Policy Manager, Google
Eilis McDaniel	Northern Ireland Executive
Paul Cording	Vodafone (in place of Cindy Rose)
Bradley Finn	UKCCIS Secretariat (to present an item)
Alison Preston	Ofcom (to present an item)
Emily Keaney	Ofcom (to present an item)
Andrew Przybylski	Oxford Internet Institute (to present an item)
Sam Gubb	UK/US Taskforce To Counter Online Child Exploitation, Home Office (to present an item)

Apologies received from:

Peter Liver,	NSPCC
Simon Milner	Facebook
Sonia Livingstone	LSE
Nicola Hodson	Microsoft
Jonny Gwynne	Director, CEOP
Cindy Rose	Managing Director, Consumer Division, Vodafone
Alexandra Birtles	Head of External Communications, TalkTalk
Claire Thwaites	Apple
Aleyne Johnson	Head of Government Relations, Samsung

Observers:

Isabel Evans	Department for Education (PS/Edward Timpson)
Rebecca Taylor	HO (PS/Mike Penning)
Silvia Fukuoka	Ofcom
Anna Payne	DCMS (Secretariat)
Ellie Mond	DCMS (Secretariat)
Samantha Kelly	DCMS (Secretariat)

Item 1 - Welcome, introductions, apologies and declaring interests

1. The Chair opened the meeting and introduced himself to Board Members.
2. The Chair asked if there were any comments on the actions from the previous board – none were mentioned. He also reminded members to declare interests, where appropriate, in advance of discussion on agenda items.
3. John Carr declared his involvement with Motion Pictures Association.

Item 2 – Recent research and discussion

4. **Alison Preston and Emily Keaney from Ofcom** gave a presentation on the key findings from their latest research into children’s media use and attitudes, including some qualitative research about risk and trust online.
5. The research showed that access to the internet and ownership of devices has changed significantly since 2011 and there has been a big increase in the numbers of children using mobiles and tablets, especially among younger children. Patterns are even more pronounced for 3-4 year olds.
6. Children’s online experiences are on smaller, more mobile, more private devices so supervision is more difficult – it’s no longer a question of having a PC in the living room.
7. Parents use a combination of approaches, including supervision, rules and technical tools. 84% were aware of one or more of 8 technical tools. More than half use any of these 8 tools. 21% of parents use network level home filtering tools.
8. The vast majority of parents using home filters find them useful (93%) and say they block the right amount (73%).
9. Reasons given as to why they aren’t used include preferring to talk to children, using other forms of mediation, and trusting children. 1 in 5 say their child is always supervised.
10. Ofcom commissioned Sherbert Research to conduct qualitative research about attitudes to issues of risk and trust. Most children are aware of risks and are able to repeat safety messages. However younger children often don’t understand why – parents are reluctant to explain the reasons and so children ‘backfill’ information. For example, younger children assume that they shouldn’t give out personal details because they might be kidnapped.
11. Older children will take risks if the reward is significant enough. This is a normal part of growing up.
12. Talking and listening to children is extremely important and needs to be on-going, not a one-off.

13. Protecting kids from harmful content is not enough to ensure they are engaging in a safe, critical and informed way. They need to be able to understand, for instance, where content is coming from, when to treat it with scepticism and when they're recipients of advertising. There is a need to encourage critical understanding and thinking around online advertising - for instance, a large number of children do not understand that searches via Google result in advertising at the 'top' in the results.
14. **Andrew Przybylski, a research psychologist and fellow at the University of Oxford** gave a presentation of research done with Parentzone and Virgin Media looking at children's resilience online from a psychological perspective. In general, research seems to focus on concerns about young people online, but so far there has been little on the resilience side..
15. The research involved a nationally representative sample of 14-17 year olds, and looked at how social environment, digital skills and interaction with parents feeds into online experiences. The sample was taken from across Great Britain and based on self-reported interviews.
16. It considered the effect on online resilience of three factors highlighted in existing literature (Parental Involvement; Parental Autonomy Support; Parental Unconditional Regard), as well as digital mediation strategies.
17. The two key research questions were:
 - a. How do caregiver climate, digital mediation strategies, and digital skills relate to online resilience in young people?
 - b. How do digital mediation strategies, digital skills, and online resilience relate to young people engaging actively online?
18. The research found that all factors of good parenting positively related to children being resilient online. It also found that restrictive mediation was negatively related to kids being resilient online. Digital skills were found to be positively related to active engagement and resilient self-regulation.
19. The findings suggested that only focusing on bans and prohibitions might not be a good thing with unforeseen consequences. Building digital skills is important in building resilience.
- 20. Discussion followed and points raised included:**
 - Ofcom research looks at levels of awareness of default parental controls on mobile phones and finds that around half of parents are unaware of the adult bar on mobiles. Among those who are aware, a further half don't know whether the adult content bar is in place.
 - It is important to remember the age range of the resilience research (14-17 year olds). Filtering is of declining utility as children get older. As mentioned in the Ofcom report (about the large number of 3-4 year olds using tablets)- filters will have greater utility for younger children.
 - Some were pleased to hear 1 in 5 parents are actively supervising their children's internet use. If this is true, it's good news.
 - There's a difference between active and draconian mediation. Different shades of mediation are available, including the use of a range of different technical tools.
 - Resilience research showed if children felt they could speak to their parents , it's more important than filtering.

- Is there a correlation between the age of parents and children’s digital skills? Whilst technology will inevitably always move on, is there a tipping point when that gap in knowledge is much smaller? The received wisdom is that this is the last generation of parents who aren’t digital natives, however this doesn’t necessarily mean that the new generation are any better at protecting our children.
- Ofcom research takes the age of parents into account, and they will consider this point. They have also commissioned research tracking 18 children (aged 8-15) over 3 years. This will include talking to parents so will provide a useful picture of mediation strategies.
- Is there any technology to make sure age appropriateness of adverts is synonymous for content, to ensure children are not looking at inappropriate adverts? All US based social media and technology companies will have strict policies on what services they can offer to children under 13. Google had announced the day before that they are looking into how to target Google products for under-13 year olds.
- There aren’t any areas of a child’s life where having an engaged parent doesn’t help.
- This is a useful conclusion but it is unsurprising that children under tighter protection have less resilience – this is a classic parenting challenge. Age is relevant - as children grow, you expect to need different strategies.

Action: Andrew will consider whether there is further information that would be useful for the Board – if so, he will circulate this.

Action: Ofcom extended an invitation to Board members for a more in-depth discussion of these research findings at 2.30-5pm on Tuesday 20 January, at Riverside House. Contact Alison Mountain on alison.mountain@ofcom.org.uk for details.

Action: Tink Palmer to talk to Andrew Przybylski as her experience in this field differs in some perspectives with his research findings.

Item 3 – Strategic Review – Bradley Finn

- 21. The review was commissioned in March. Thanks to all contributors – here and elsewhere. Recommendations were circulated prior to the meeting.
- 22. In summary – collective work is required to keep UKCCIS more engaged. We want it to be a strong multi-stakeholder group.
- 23. Recommendations include:**
 - A newsletter for wider council members.
 - Communicating the importance of UKCCIS to the wider public – demonstrate why it’s a strong model
 - Making meetings more effective by setting meeting dates and sending papers early. There is also an obligation on the Exec Board to keep the

Secretariat informed of developments, and request/ propose/ require agenda items.

- Calling ad-hoc COBR style meetings if there's a pressing need to meet.
- It was concluded that a large group is needed as the Board represents many sectors.
- Now that Clare Perry is no longer on the board, the Ministerial co-Chairs had agreed to invite a representative from No.10.
- To actively consider future priorities.
- Making working groups more effective. Some already are obviously effective, such as Overblocking and Evidence, groups. However, some working groups don't meet regularly and have no clear terms of reference – if inactive, they should be closed.
- Some suggested amendments to working groups, for instance merging all the parental control filter groups into one.

24. Discussion points included:

- More should be done to join up the dots - the working group proposal will help - e.g. overblocking is relevant to extremism.
- The Home Office Summit work is not reflected in work of UKCCIS but should be. A working group looking at online child sexual exploitation should be set up. The delivery of pledges might be appropriate for a working group.
- There is a need to consider what UKCCIS is for - if we want senior engagement, we need to ensure the executive moulds policy. Communicating news is good, but if senior people are in the room, UKCCIS needs to be a decision making forum.
- UKCCIS should also look at vulnerable groups.
- To encourage the group to work on longer term polices might require more ambitious priorities – many of the PM's commitments are now complete. We should consider broader themes, new areas and topics.
- We're engaged in a big experiment, but we don't yet know how effective or useful these measures are going to be. Government needs a mechanism for keeping tabs on outcomes. Ad-hoc research is useful, but can't be relied upon as a proper, long-term measuring tool to track and evaluate effectiveness.
- A working group on encryption was proposed, to explore how technical tools are being abused. This should involve industry and experts.

25. The strategic review paper was agreed.

Action: At the next meeting, consider the case for setting up a working group on encryption and another on online child sexual exploitation.

Action: Secretariat to circulate a summary of each working group. The Co-chairs will invite all working groups to present at the next meeting – UKCCIS will then collectively set objectives and consider if there are other groups that should be reformed or other work that should be done under UKCCIS.

Action: Tink Palmer, Susie Hargreaves and Claire Lilley to discuss the need for renewed focus around vulnerable groups, and report back to the Board.

Action: the Secretariat should send out papers further in advance.

Item 4 – Overblocking Working Group – Dave Miles

26. Dave offered his thanks to stakeholders who have devoted time and energy to this work, and to DCMS for their support.
27. Dave discussed the concept of a list and pilot list, and extending the working group, when he recently met Ed Vaizey. This proposal was agreed at the working group on 24 November. However, a subsequent email from YouthNet, Brooke and ParentZone stated:

“It is our view that the universally accessible approach is no longer needed. This was proposed at meetings with a number of ISPs in Spring and raised in the paper to the over blocking group in July. Our key concern was that children and young people in times of crisis always have somewhere to turn in an emergency. We anticipated this would be a very small number of sites and that it would be combined with improved communications at the point of filtering. However, over the last few months, through the productive conversations and meetings outside of the group meeting with the ISPs, we believe that most of what we would consider emergency support is in fact now accessible. This was confirmed by BT’s confirmation that all Childline support including their forums were accessible.

We think that trying to agree the criteria for a larger list (it has been suggested of 40 or so sites), will be very difficult and hard to justify to the rest of the sector. We also don’t believe it addresses the wider complex issues we feel we still need to focus upon to meet the PM’s objectives for the group”
28. Working group participants brought new thinking and challenges, including about content over form and the potential for a universal list of sites.
29. The ISP Demonstration recently hosted at DCMS was helpful, and ISPs have made a real effort to share information with the group. The filters are not fixed products and ISPs are investing time and money to get them right. There have been low levels of reported overblocking with network filters.
30. KCOM and others have emulated many of the filtering features implemented by the four leading UK ISPs – it’s an excellent example of how UKCCIS and the working group’s best practice is having a broader and positive impact.
31. Youth charities and the games sector contributed useful white papers to discussions. Areas to focus on next include engaging with the wider charity sector, improving the nternet Matters reporting link and addressing questions about form and content.
32. Dave recommends ending the working group as it currently stands, but continuing to address these issues through a subset of the new collective filtering working group.

33. Discussion points included:

- UKCCIS should continue to monitor and re-open the working group if needed. The group has addressed what might otherwise have been a serious problem.
- We've got to a good position on this, our next step is to help the voluntary sector to understand the filters.
- The discussion about form vs. content should continue as part of the new working group.

Action: Dave Miles to write a report on lessons learned for the March UKCCIS Executive Board.

Daniel Butler, Adam Kinsley, Julian Ashworth left the meeting at 15:45

Item 5 – #WeProtect Summit to Tackle Online Child Sexual Exploitation

34. On 10th and 11th December there will be an international #We Protect Summit to Tackle online Child Sexual Exploitation – this follows recent meetings in the commitment made by the Prime Minister in November 2013.
35. Delegates will include UKCCIS members, the US Assistant Attorney General, and Ministers from around the world. 51 countries (incl. Africa) are attending, and not just those from the global alliance. The UN special envoy and NGOs are also invited.
36. There are no international boundaries in these crimes but there is still some denial about this issue and its severity.
37. The theme of the Summit is about what we can all do together.

38. Discussion points included:

- Companies were only given 5 days to look at the principles they are expected to sign up to. The Chair noted that hopefully everyone has what they need now in terms of preparation, and that they should talk to the Home Office team working on this if not.

Item 6 – Any Other Business

39. Next meeting 2-5pm Tuesday 24 February, chaired by Ed Vaizey (**the Secretariat will send a separate invitation**).
40. General Election – the Chair re-affirmed that no matter what government comes in, this work will carry on.
41. Susie Hargreaves from IWF would like to present at the next meeting as it will be a year since proactive searching was introduced. She will update the Board on the impact of this work.
42. Will Gardner reminded the Board that Safer Internet Day will be on 10th February – and noted that this is a big education and awareness-raising opportunity. Ed Vaizey and Edward Timpson will be attending.
43. Anne Heal of Openreach is standing down as chair of the Public Wi-Fi Working group after nearly three years. Please see Annex A for an update on the Friendly Wi-Fi Initiative.

44. Andrew Uden has left Tesco. If anyone would like to nominate a replacement, please contact the UKCCIS Secretariat.
45. We thank them for their involvement and wish them well.

Action: Secretariat to see whether the March meeting could be extended to three hours instead of two.

Action: Secretariat to circulate further information about Safer Internet Day.

Annex A

Update On Public Wi-Fi – Friendly Wi-Fi Initiative

Progress continues on a numbers of fronts with RDI marketing actively to extend the scheme membership and sign up providers who can deliver the offering. In addition to the original providers who first worked on the Friendly WiFi activity, there are now 10 approved providers and another 23 going through accreditation to demonstrate that they can meet the scheme standards. Providers are working with RDI to promote the scheme to their clients and act as advocates. As a result there is a healthy pipeline of clients at various stages of the signup process. The range of the businesses involved is extensive, from airports to theme parks to shopping centres and schools, corner shops and hairdressers.

As the provider base grows, the development of the approved providers is bringing a wider range of providers up to the standard and creating an invaluable database of what is filtered and by whom. It is also clear that there the market is developing and increasingly retailers are using providers/resellers outside of the big6 who were involved in the original commitment.

Tesco and Starbucks are both due to launch a major promotional campaign around their WiFi provision in general in early 2015 and this will be a key part of that story. (It is likely that the larger brands will seek to include friendly WiFi as part of their overall WiFi positioning rather than as a stand alone campaign; it is also worth saying that dealing with large brands is not a rapid process and Christmas preparations (which start early in the year) have not helped progress in the worlds of retail and leisure.

Despite that, the signing of Caffè Nero has boosted Chester's bid to be the first porn free city. Cities are a new and important part of this; York are just about to complete the accreditation process and dialogue is underway with a number of key UK cities as part of the Super Connected cities activity; DCMS are also looking at library engagement.

RDI are working with a number of supporters, including CEOP, the Child Safety Summit and Cyber Streetwise.

Overall, there continues to be momentum, with both providers and customers coming to RDI or being actively referred.

Awareness research will start during the coming months and RDI will come to UKCCIS in the Spring to present. Anne Heal is standing down after nearly 3 years in the Public WiFi role, she will be handing over in the coming weeks.